ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT – SCOPING PHASE

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW DOUBLE CIRCUIT 400 kV TRANSMISSION POWER LINE BETWEEN THE ETNA SUBSTATION (near Ennerdale) AND GLOCKNER SUBSTATION (near Rothdene), GAUTENG PROVINCE

SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES/CONCERNS AND SUGGESTIONS RAISED BY INTERESTED AND/OR AFFECTED

NOVEMBER 2006 – FEBRUARY 2007

Stakeholders who contributed issues range across all sectors of society. A full record of every issue raised is available from the public participation offices. Many stakeholders raised the same issue. This list of issues does not focus solely on a specific route corridor or alternative. Instead, it lists all the issues raised by I&APs throughout the study area. In many instances, an issue raised about a particular corridor/alternative, is also applicable to other corridors/alternatives.

The issues have been arranged into groups of similar issues, and are listed in each group more or less in the order in which they were received. The name, affiliation and date of the commentator are also indicated. The affiliation, where indicated, of the person who raised the comment is indicated; as it was at the time the comment was raised. The issues raised by technical specialists and the project proponents are not included in the list below. Comments made during public meetings are however, included, as well as comments received in Afrikaans and African languages. These are translated into English for Report purposes.

INDEX TO ISSUES IN THIS TABLE

1.	AVIFAUNA ISSUES	1
2.	SOCIAL AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC ISSUES	1
3.	EIA PROCESS ISSUES	3
4.	PROPOSED ROUTES & ROUTE ALTERNATIVES	4
5.	IMPACTS ON EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE/SERVITUDES	5
6.	CONSTRUCTION ISSUES	8
7.	COMMUNICATION ISSUES	10
8.	GENERAL COMMENTS & ISSUES RAISED	13
9.	AUTHORITY COMMENTS	15

Note that issues raised by potentially affected landowners are included here as general statements and principles to be borne in mind, rather than providing the exact localised details provided by the commentator.

ABBREVIATIONS USED IN THIS ISSUES TRAIL:

FGM:	Focus Group Meeting	PM:	Public Meeting	ESR:	Environmental Scoping Report	KSW:	Key Stakeholder Workshop
DM:	District Municipality	LM:	Local Municipality				

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
1. AVIFAUNA ISSUES			
Thanked the team for informing them of the proposed project The South African Crane Working Group of the EWT will not be registering as an interested and affected party for this power line. Reason being, the Eskom-EWT Strategic Partnership in the form of Van Rooyen, Smallie et al. All crane information will be forwarded to the above parties for incorporation in to their report. In that way EWT avoid the same organisation being an I&AP and a specialist consultant at the same time.	South African Crane Working Group, Endangered Wildlife Trust E-mail: 19 01 2006	Comment acknowledged.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
2. SOCIAL AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC ISSUES			
The concern was raised regarding the possible impact on residents who could be directly impacted, e.g. power line over their houses, and enquire whether these residents will be relocated.	Nompo Zondi, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	Eskom try to minimize any environmental and social impacts as far as possible, but should a re-alignment to avoid houses not be possible Eskom will, in consultation, relocate those affected residents. Eskom needs their servitude to be clear of any obstructions, not only for maintenance, but also from a safety point of view for people. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
It was enquired as to what impact will the power line have on people's health.	Vusi Seane, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	The environmental specialists will be assessing this aspect. Desmond Musetsho, Eskom	
How high will the power line be construction to limit the electromagnetic field (EMF) impacts?	Linda Dlamini, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	There is a certain height that the power line will be constructed and the width of the servitude (95m registered servitude per 400kV line) will ensure that the EMFs impact on people is limited.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
		Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
How long is to take before construction start and in terms of labour or jobs how is it going to assist our local community? And has the municipality been consulted for any future development.	Committee Member, City	The EIA process may go up to July 2007, and other process will follow, such as Negotiation process and it is on this process where all affected people will be consulted and a form of contract or agreement may be signed with those people. When it comes to the jobs or labourers or jobs, Eskom appoints the contractors and the contractors may need a labourer and they are likely to appoint or need assistance from the local people. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
During construction (when tenders are advertised for contractors to bid) will it be advertised locally?	Mr Khomotso Rutlokoane, Ward Committee Member, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Ones a preferred route is found then the tender will come out as an advert and in that way everyone is opened to tender. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
It is proposed that the Councillors be informed when the advertisements comes out in newspapers, because in this community there are well skilled electricians who may be interested in these kind of the jobs.		Proposal noted. Ones the route is found then the tender will come out as an advert and in that way everyone is opened to tender. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
Skills transfer should not be denied to our local community	Mr Thabo Moshoeshoe, Ward Committee Member, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Comment noted.	
There are a lot of Bluegum trees in the area, and people use them to steal electrical cables. The matter was reported this to Eskom (person called Jonas) but no response has been		Concern noted. Matter will be forwarded to Eskom Distribution to follow up. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
received.	Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007		

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
3. EIA PROCESS ISSUES			
What is the relationship between Naledzi and Eskom?	Mpumelelo Maputi, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	Naledzi Environmental is the independent environmental consultants that is appointed by Eskom through their independent tender process. As EIAs need to be done for all proposed developments, Government stated that the project proponent (Eskom for this project) must pay the consultants' fees. The environmental consultant prior to starting the work signs a Declaration of Independence. Nicolene Venter, Naledzi Environmental Naledzi Naledzi Environmental Consultants are not allowed to have any vested interest in the project and once the RoD has been issued, there is no relationship between Naledzi Environmental and Eskom.	
It was enquired whether rehabilitation will take place after construction.	Mr Lazarus Ramalobela, Telkom Key Stakeholder Workshop: 29 01 2006	Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi EnvironmentalAn Environmental Management Plan document will be drafted to address the environmental impacts during and after construction as well as the rehabilitation to be done on the servitude during the operational phase. Eskom will also appoint an Environmental Control Officer who will daily be on site during the construction phase.Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
4. PROPOSED ROUTES & ROUTE ALTERNATIVES			
The project team was informed that during the presentation it was mentioned that there are two route alternatives, but according to the map included in the BID, there is only one route alternative.	Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting: 24 11 06	the study area currently is a six (6) kilometers corridor over a distance of 30km in which the two to three proposed route alternatives still need to be identified. The line indicated on the locality map indicates the <i>center line</i> of the study area. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
What percentage of the proposed power line will affect the Evaton area during the construction phase? It was mentioned that looking at the Evaton area there is no space for a power line to be located there.	Shadrack Zondi, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	The area, as indicated on the map in the BID is still a study area. A definite response cannot be provided at this stage, but as the project unfolds, the information will be provided to the I&APs. Eskom doesn't want people to live under the power line, could be a communication with the appointed contractor and the affected people for relocation. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
Are there any existing power lines between Etna- and Glockner substations?	Linda Dlamini, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting:	There is no existing power line between Etna- and Glockner substations. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
Why can't the proposed power line not follow the existing power line?	27 01 2007	Should the existing power line route from Brenner substation – Lethabo power station to Glockner substation be followed, it would be too expensive and the end user will then carry the increased costs. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
It was suggested that during decision-making, the two 400kvs should be separated, one running on one corridor and the other doing the same. This will help a lot to avoid major impacts in areas such as Sweet Waters were there are future developments planned.	Mr Thabo Moshoeshoe, Ward Committee Member, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Suggestion noted.	
If it were his decision, whether to build two lines running	Clr Paul Molutsi, City of	It will be possible, however consideration must be given to the	

Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting	fact that two separate power lines will affect more people than building two parallel to each other. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
	Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality	Johannesburgfact that two separate power lines will affect more people than building two parallel to each other.Focus Group MeetingPervelen Govender, Eskom

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
5. IMPACTS ON EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE/SEF	RVITUDES		
The concern was raised regarding the fact that Eskom's servitudes are not maintained properly and it is a huge fire hazard.		Concern noted.	
Are any additional substations being planned around Vaal area?	Clr Pat Hutchinson, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	This project focus only on the proposed construction of a 400kV Transmission power line between Etna- and Glockner Substations and that a new substation does nor form part of this EIA. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
Who owns the servitude?	Mrs Haz Hassim, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	Eskom only register the servitude as "a right of way", and does not own the portion of land that the servitude is registered on. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
It was enquired whether Eskom is involved with the various development planning in the study area with regards to address the need for energy supply for the proposed developments.	Midvaal Local	The proposed project will benefit all the areas along its path whether it is a new development or existing.He requested the environmental team to ensure that they are aware of all the proposed development planned within the study area. Bobby Richardson, Eskom	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Lazarus Ramalobela made a follow with the Lethabo and	Mr Lazarus Ramalobela,	Lethabo is an existing power station and Glockner is an existing	
Glockner substations if are the existing substations.	Telkom	substation, and currently Lethabo power station is supplying	
	Key Stakeholder	Glockner substation with power. This project is proposing a	
	Workshop:	power supply from Glockner- to Etna substation.	
	29 01 2006	Pervelene Govender, Eskom	
It was requested that NEC include the Aviation Act together	Mr Carl Gersbach, Air	Request noted. The co-ordinates of the preferred route	
with the other Acts mentioned in the presentation. He	Traffic & Navigation	alignment will be forwarded to the ATNS.	
requested NEC to provide the ATNS with the co-ordinates of	Services	Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
line masts.	Key Stakeholder		
	Workshop:		
	29 01 2006		

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
a 50m high line, passing south of the Vereeniging aerodrome Inspect (FAVV), would have on the operation of the aerodrome. The Aerod aerodrome, being a code 2 non-precision instrument Overs aerodrome, requires an obstacle free approach slope of 3,3% Author	IP Pretorius, bector CNS: bdrome Safety rsight, Civil Aviation hority hail: 19 01 2006	Request noted and information would be forwarded as part of the process.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
What would the environmental impact be should the power line run along or crossing streams?	Vusi Seane, Resident, Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	Desmond Musetsho replied that an Environmental Management Plan will be compiled, which will highlight sensitive environmental areas to be avoided during the construction process. This will definitely include areas where possible stream/river crossings are envisaged.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
6. CONSTRUCTION ISSUES			
How will roads (e.g. Golden highway) and railway lines be crossed to ensure the minimum impact on traffic flow.	Vusi Seane, Resident, Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	Meetings with local authorities are in the process of taking place to ensure that a safe construction method will be followed. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental As mentioned during the presentation, structures are constructed adjacent to roads to ensure that the conductors (power lines) do not touch the ground. During construction of a power line, Eskom work in close relation with the traffic departments of the local authorities. It was also mentioned that helicopters are sometimes used for the stringing of the conductors. Should traffic be affected during construction, Eskom will communicate these impacts prior to construction to the communities in the area. Kedibone Matlhabegoane	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
		Lesley Naidoo informed the attendees that	
What is the construction time frame once the project is	Clr Franci Hossack,	It is envisaged that constructed will take place between 2009	
approved?	Midvaal Local	and 2010.	
	Municipality	Pervelene Govender, Eskom	
	Key Stakeholder		
	Workshop:		
	29 01 2007		
It was enquired whether any services, such as Telkom, would	Mr Lazarus Ramalobela,	It is most likely that some services providers infrastructures will	
be affected by the proposed project.	Telkom	be impacted and those impacts will be discussed and negotiated	
	Key Stakeholder	with the relevant service provider.	
	Workshop:	Bobby Richardson, Eskom	
	29 01 2007		

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
7. COMMUNICATION ISSUES			
Will the communities be involved in the public participation process?	Clr C Hartman, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	Communities will be part of the public participation process. By presenting the project to the Councillors of the Local Municipalities, it is envisaged that they will inform their constituencies of the proposed project. A communication process focusing on the communities will also be conducted. Nicolene Venter, Naledzi Environmental	
It was requested that the Background Information Document (BID) be available in a local language to assist the communities in understanding the proposed project. It was also requested that copies of the SiSotho translated BID be delivered to their office before Thursday, to enable Midvaal Local Municipality to distribute it to the various Councillors who will distribute it to the communities.		The BID is currently in the process of being translated and should it be available before Thursday, sufficient copies will be delivered to Midvaal Local Municipal offices. Nicolene Venter, Naledzi Environmental	
It was suggested that the public meetings should not be held during December 2006 due to the school holidays. It is suggested that the public meetings be held after the 15 th of January 2007.		Comment noted. The project team will assess the matter.	
It was requested that Eskom arrange a presentation to the Mayoral Committee of their whole strategy / planning for the Midvaal Local Municipality area.	Mr D Meyer, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	Request acknowledged and informed the attendees that the matter will be forwarded to Eskom Strategic Planning Department. Kedibone Matlhabegoane	
The project team was informed that Eskom is planning a new substation in the Midvaal Local Municipality area and that an EIA is currently being conducted.		Comment noted.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
 Requested that the following three organisations be registered as I&APs: Thorntree Conservancy mail to be sent to ivan@thorntree.co.za; Gauteng Conservancy Association mail to be sent to dehning@mweb.co.za and cc to conservancies@conservancies.org; and National Association of Conservancies of South Africa nacsa@nacsa.org.za 	Thorntree Conservancy; Chairman Gauteng Conservancy Association; Executive Committee National Association of Conservancies of South Africa; Steering Committee National Biodiversity Stewardship Programme DEAT; Steering Committee Gauteng Plant Rescue	Request acknowledge and BID forwarded to registered I&APs	
What is the planning on the area to be developed? What is feature with development?	E-mail: 08 12 2006 Unidentified Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	On the public meeting to be held we will invite a member from the planning section. The scoping process is there specifically to identify some of the developments taking place in the area so that they can be taken into consideration during power line planning. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
When will the next meeting be held and how can the Evaton community participate as an I&AP if they are not employed and do not have access to telephones or fax machines.		This is the only public meeting in Evaton during the scoping phase, and the next public meeting will be held during the impact assessment phase, should the preferred alignment traverses the Evaton area. It was agreed that communication between Evaton community and NEC will be through the community representatives. Nicolene Venter, Naledzi Environmental	
It was enquired whether the project team is aware of the future developments in Sweet Waters and whether the local municipality has been contacted regarding this project? Since the project seems to affect more of Ward 6, when exactly are we going to meet the community from this ward?		Comment noted. Consultation is currently taking place with the various local municipalities. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom During the second phase of the EIA process since we have already conducted public meetings Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Are the local municipalities being consulted about the future developments?	Unknown delegate. City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Local Municipalities are being consulted and the implication of putting these two lines separately might be greater on socio- economic impact and environmental. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
In which newspapers was the project advertised?	Clr Paul Molutsi, Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Lenasia Times, Daily Sun, Sowetan, Beeld, Vaal Vision Meyerton Weekly Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
It is suggested that Councillors be informed of the day the notice will be place on a newspaper or advertised on a local radio station, this is to let the community in advance that the advert is out because not all of the community members read newspapers everyday or listen to the same radio stations.		Suggestion noted	
It is suggested and recommended that the next round of meetings to be after finalisation of choosing the alternative routes.	Mr Thabo Moshoeshoe, Ward Committee Member, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	It is the plan to do so since the EIA process will be followed. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
It was enquired whether the information received about a similar project at the end of last year and in January 2007, is the same project? If so, what is expected from us as Councillors if the Municipal Manager commented?	Clr Gqelosha Msebenzi, Emfuleni Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Information was distributed to the various local municipalities and Councillors, and responses were received from Municipal Manager. Councillors' viewpoint is requested as they are in contact with their constituencies on a daily basis. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	

	Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
--	---------------	-----------	----------	-----------------------------

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
8. GENERAL COMMENTS & ISSUES RAISED			
What is the purpose of the proposed power line?	Vusi Seane, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	There is a constrain on the power supply network between Eiger, Brener and Lethabo Substations and. To address this constrain, the two 400kV power lines are being proposed between Glockner substation (as the source) and Etna substation. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
What is the time frame of the Etna and Glockner project?	Sebongile Hlongwane, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	The EIA process is a long process and it is envisaged that the EIA process will take place until July 2007. Should a positive RoD be issued by DEAT, Eskom still need to undertake their negotiation process with affected landowners and residents, before construction can commence. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
What will the community gain from the proposed project?		Should Eskom not build this proposed power line, electricity supply to the area will always be a problem. For the construction of the power line Eskom will appoint a contractor who specialises in the construction of power lines, and the contractor might source local labour as and when needed, Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
What benefits will this project have for the end users? It was enquired whether residents will have to minimize their power cards that are currently being used at their homes.	Nomasonto Mbele Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	This proposed project would not <i>directly</i> affect the end users' power supply, as it is a transmission power line from one substation to another. However, by constructing this transmission power line, it would strengthen the power supply in the area. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	
Does this project forms part of the Evaton Renewal Project?	Witness Ramokopo, Resident: Evaton Public Meeting: 27 01 2007	Eskom Transmission are not aware of such project and requested that the information regarding this project be forwarded to the project team. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Is this project required because of the recent national power failure or is the power failure because of the existing long route of power sully in south of Johannesburg?	Mr Thabo Moshoeshoe, Ward Committee Member, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	The power failure experience was due to a national failure/problem where during maintenance one of the generators failed and cost the whole failure. Apart from that the project team present cannot comment. Currently a preferred alignment has not yet been identified. Prevelen Govender, Eskom It indicated that the proposed route of this powerline is presented on a map and everyone will be given an opportunity to have a look at it. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
Should Eskom succeed with the project, is it going to benefit the consumers?	Clr Freedom Sotshantshe, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Its consumers pay for all Eskom's activities, so indirectly if Eskom gets a cheaper route, then the consumers might also pay less. Prevelen Govender, Eskom	
When is Eskom going to build more generators?	Mr Kgomotso Rutlokoane, City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality Focus Group Meeting 13 02 2007	Eskom is in a process of addressing electricity supply throughout the country, and that forms part of the planning processes. It is envisaged that around 2010, there would be enough generators to supply the electricity capacity needed. Pervelen Govender, Eskom	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
9. AUTHORITY COMMENTS			
The project team was informed that during the presentation it was mentioned that there are two route alternatives, but according to the map included in the BID, there is only one route alternative.	Ms MT Mollo, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting: 24 11 06	the study area currently is a six (6) kilometers corridor over a distance of 30km in which the two proposed route alternatives still need to be identified. The line indicated on the locality map indicates the <i>center line</i> of the study area. Desmond Musetsho, Naledzi Environmental	
The concern was raised regarding the fact that Eskom's servitudes are not maintained properly and it is a huge fire hazard.	Mr Eugine Lensley, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	Concern noted.	
Are any additional substations being planned around Vaal area?	Clr Pat Hutchinson, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	This project focus only on the proposed construction of a 400kV Transmission power line between Etna- and Glockner Substations and that a new substation does nor form part of this EIA. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
Who owns the servitude?	Mrs Haz Hassim, Midvaal Local Municipality Focus Group Meeting 24 11 2006	Eskom only register the servitude as "a right of way", and does not own the portion of land that the servitude is registered on. Kedibone Matlhabegoane, Eskom	
It was enquired whether Eskom is involved with the various development planning in the study area with regards to address the need for energy supply for the proposed developments.	Clr Franci Hossack, Midvaal Local Municipality Key Stakeholder Workshop: 29 01 2006	The proposed project will benefit all the areas along its path whether it is a new development or existing.He requested the environmental team to ensure that they are aware of all the proposed development planned within the study area. Bobby Richardson, Eskom	
It was requested that Eskom arrange a presentation to the Mayoral Committee of their whole strategy / planning for the Midvaal Local Municipality area.	-	Request acknowledged and informed the attendees that the matter will be forwarded to Eskom Strategic Planning Department. Kedibone Matlhabegoane	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
The project team was informed that Eskom is planning a new substation in the Midvaal Local Municipality area and that an		Comment noted.	
EIA is currently being conducted.			