

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT – SCOPING PHASE

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

**PROPOSED EXTENSION OF THE 765kV TRANSMISSION HYDRA SUBSTATION
AND THE ADDITIONAL 765kV TRANSMISSION POWER LINE BETWEEN HYDRA
SUBSTATION AND GAMMA SUBSTATION: NORTHERN CAPE PROVINCE**

**SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL COMMENTS/ISSUES/CONCERNS AND SUGGESTIONS
RAISED BY INTERESTED AND/OR AFFECTED PARTIES**

NOVEMBER 2006

Stakeholders who contributed issues range across all sectors of society. A full record of every issue raised is available from the public participation offices. Many stakeholders raised the same issue. This list of issues does not focus solely on the specific route corridor. Instead, it lists all the issues raised by I&APs within the study area.

The issues have been arranged into groups of similar issues, and are listed alphabetically (according to surname). The name, affiliation and date of the commentator are also indicated. The affiliation, where indicated, of the person who raised the comment is indicated; as it was at the time the comment was raised. The issues raised by technical specialists and the project proponents are not included in the list below.

INDEX TO ISSUES IN THIS TABLE

1. GENERAL ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES.....

2. FAUNA & FLORA ISSUES

3. AVIFAUNA ISSUES

4. TOURISM ISSUES

5. SOCIAL ISSUES

6. PROPOSED ROUTES & ROUTE ALTERNATIVES

7. SERVITUDE ISSUES.....

8. TECHNICAL ISSUES.....

9. CONSTRUCTION ISSUES

10. COMMENTS & CONCERNS – ESKOM EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE/SERVITUDE

11. HYDRA-GAMMA 1 RELATED ISSUES

12. COMMUNICATION ISSUES

13. GENERAL COMMENTS & ISSUES RAISED

ABBREVIATIONS USED IN THE ISSUES TRAIL:

FGM: Focus Group Meeting

EMP: Environmental Management Plan

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
1. GENERAL ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES			
During construction litter is a problem. Eskom must ensure clean up is conducted on completion.	Mr Hendrik de Jager: Property Owner, De Put Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Piet Schoeman: Property Owner, Niewfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted. This matter will be included into the EMP.	X
Contract makes no provision for rehabilitation and contract must specify rehabilitation	Mr A Duthie: Property Owner, Wodehouse Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	
There is no compensation for damage to natural vegetation and crops.			
Eskom has embarked on bush cutting on his property which has led to soil erosion occurring and does not want any further bush cutting to take place. Has contacted Eskom about erosion and Eskom agreed to put gabions in at needed areas. Awaits a quote.	Marius Esterhuizen: Property Owners, Wynandsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted and will be addressed during the impact phase	X
Eskom must ensure that no erosion takes place and must put preventative measure in place.	Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Peter Kock: Property Owners, Lemoenkloof Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Piet Schoeman: Property Owner, Niewfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment and concern noted.	X

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
	Pikkie van den Heever: Property Owner, Grootaar CC Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Frans van der Merwe: Property Owner, Rondavel & Annex Rondawel Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
Roads must not be scraped or graded as this promotes erosion. The two track roads must remain.	F J de Vries: Property Owners, Bult & Rietfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	
It was indicated that he is not in favour of construction if current erosion problem has not been adequately repaired. Local Eskom representative informed him that there is no budget for erosion control.	Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	
Erosion is currently being attended to.	Fred Van Zyl: Property Owner, Fred van Zyl Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
2. FAUNA & FLORA ISSUES			
What the status of the vegetation will be after the expansion of the Hydra Substation and will that site be rehabilitated?	Mr Alexander, Municipal Manager: Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	The vegetation at the substation site will be permanently removed, and were possible any indigenous species will be relocated within the nearby vicinity. It was explained that in order for the construction of the substation site to be approved, the ecological studies need to show that the vegetation at that site is either in abundance elsewhere, such that the population of that species will not suffer, or alternatively the vegetation can be relocated elsewhere to ensure the survival of the species.	
It takes 4 years for any significant rehabilitation to occur and therefore care must be taken during construction to not unnecessarily destroy vegetation.	Mr Hendrik de Jager: Property Owner, De Put Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	
What action will be in place should plants or trees be affected by the proposed Transmission power line?	Mr Faas, XX : Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	Should red data plant species be identified within the study area, and those species cannot be relocated, the final route alignment would have to be aligned to avoid those species.	
Eskom and contractors must not drive in the veld but remain on designated roads to minimize vegetation impact.	Luke Kock: Property Owner, Lemoenkloof Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Concern noted and forwarded to specialist.	X

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
---------------	-----------	----------	-----------------------

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
3. AVIFAUNA ISSUES			
Bird flappers on the poles and lines are not mentioned ?? and many bird deaths are occurring.	Mr A Duthie: Property Owner, Wodehouse Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Luke Kock: Property Owner, Lemoenkloof Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Pikkie van den Heever: Property Owner, Grootaar CC Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Fred Van Zyl: Property Owner, Fred van Zyl Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
There seems to be a higher mortality rate where there are a greater number of bird flaps.	Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Concern noted and forwarded to the Avifauna specialist.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Currently finding many dead Blue Cranes. Eskom to consider additional bird flaps on conductors.	Frans van der Merwe: Property Owner, Rondavel & Annex Rondawel Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted and forwarded to the Avifauna specialist.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
4. TOURISM ISSUES			
Eskom power lines are having a negative impact on his eco-tourism activities.	Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted and forwarded to the Tourism specialist.	
Tourism consultants did not visit the area to establish first hand the important issues.		Comment noted. As the project is currently in the scoping phase, only desk-top studies are being conducted. The Tourism specialist will be in contact with the landowner.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
5. SOCIAL ISSUES			
It was enquired whether there will be any Electro Magnetic Filed (EMF) radiation from the 765 kV Transmission power line.	Mr Alexander, Municipal Manager: Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	According to EMF studies undertaken for Transmission power lines, EMF radiation is highest at the centre point of a Transmission power line, and decreases in intensity as you move away from the centre point. The studies have indicated that the effects experienced by EMF's are zero outside the power line servitude. She further explained that the EMF studies will form part of the Environmental Scoping Report.	
What benefit would Emthanjeni Municipality gain from the proposed expansion of the Hydra Substation and the proposed construction of the Transmission power line? The project team was informed that Emthanjeni Municipality's existing infrastructures is 60 years old and is in need of upgrading.		The comment is noted and a response regarding this matter will be sourced from Eskom and it will also be submitted to the Social Specialist for assessment and included within the Environmental Scoping Report. Post-meeting note:	
Eskom workers, during construction and operation do not close gates, thus allowing for livestock to move out of designated camps. Eskom must ensure that workers close gates.	Mr Hendrik de Jager: Property Owner, De Put Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 HP Bekker: Property Owners, Elanskuilen Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Concern noted.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
<p>Theft and security is an issue of concern with the influx of workers and people foreign to the neighbourhood. This is particular to the sub-station on the Farm Uitsig.</p>	<p>Luke Kock: Property Owner, Lemoenkloof Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Marius Esterhuizen: Property Owners, Wynandsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Luke Kock: Property Owner, Lemoenkloof Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p>	<p>Comment noted.</p>	
<p>It was commented that numerous people living within close proximity to power line transformers had complained about headaches and migraines.</p>	<p>Mr Faas, XX: Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006</p>	<p>Health effects associated with transformers are a lot more severe than those associated with the actual power lines and power line towers.</p>	
<p>It was requested that the market value of the proposed project, including the expansion of the substation be forwarded to Emthanjeni Municipality.</p>		<p>Request noted, information will be obtained from Eskom and will be formally communicated to Emthanjeni Municipality.</p>	
<p>Would there be any local employment opportunities associated with this proposed project.</p>	<p>Mr Martin Fillis, Municipal Manager: Ubuntu Municipality FGM: 15.11.2006</p>	<p>There may be temporary jobs available during the construction phase, however Eskom have indicated that the majority of the jobs require skilled labour. An official response will be requested from Eskom, indicating the number of unskilled and skilled jobs required for the project.</p>	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
<p>The incidence of AIDS is increased by the introduction of workers and people from other areas and thus has a social impact.</p>	<p>Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p>	<p>Concern noted.</p>	
<p>It was enquired whether this project would make use of local labour during construction of the line as well as that of the expansion of the Hydra Substation. The project team was informed that although the project is being proposed to extend the electricity network for the country, Eskom’s social responsibility needs to be visible by ensuring that the community also benefit from this proposed project, if the community are not benefiting during the construction phase or the possible employment during the operational phase of the substation.</p>	<p>Mr Mvandaba: XX, Pixley Ka Seme District Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006</p>	<p>This issue is noted and that a response regarding this matter will be sourced from Eskom and it will also be submitted to the Social Specialist for assessment and included within the Environmental Scoping Report. Post-meeting note:</p>	
<p>In terms of the commitments made between Eskom and the Government to ensure that all communities receive free basic services, in this case electricity, the following comments were made and questions submitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What role is Eskom playing regarding the above-mentioned commitment in terms of infrastructures? • Emthanjeni Municipality purchase bulk electricity from Eskom for its residents and communities, but there is no return benefits from Eskom. • What will the communities benefit from this proposed project to gain the community’s buy-in into the whole process? <p>There needs to be co-operation from both Eskom and Emthanjeni Municipality to ensure a successful project.</p>		<p>From a legal and process perspective, the EIA process is there to ensure that sufficient and clear information regarding a proposed project is provided to interested and/or affected parties to participate informatively. The EIA, and specifically, the public participation process, is not a process to obtain communities or residents ‘buy-in’ into a project, but to obtain their comments and concerns relating to a proposed project, especially during the scoping phase, to ensure that it is addressed during the impact assessment phase of the project.</p>	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
6. PROPOSED ROUTES & ROUTE ALTERNATIVES			
It was enquired as to where the proposed Hydra-Gamma2 765 kV Transmission line will be situated.	Mr Mvandaba: XX , Pixley Ka Seme District Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	The proposed Hydra-Gamma2 is situated between the Hydra Substation, 10km south of De Aar And Gamma Substation, south-east of Victoria West, near Hutchinson. The Hydra Gamma2 power line will run parallel to the approved Hydra Gamma1 765 kV Power line. Ultimately, Hydra Gamma2 will be a continuation of the 765 kV power line from Perseus Substation.	
7. SERVITUDE ISSUES			
Does landowners still have the right to use the land where a Eskom servitude has been registered?	Mr Alexander, Municipal Manager: Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	The land beneath Eskom power lines still belongs to the landowners and Eskom has the right to transmit electricity within that servitude and the right to perform maintenance on the power line within that servitude. Depending on the activities e.g. low crop, cattle farming, etc farming can still take place within the servitude beneath the power line.	
8. TECHNICAL ISSUES			
Will the newly proposed expansion of the Hydra 765 kV Transmission substation be similar to the existing substation?	Mr Faas, XX : Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	After construction, the Hydra substation will be approximately double its current size. The extended Hydra Substation infrastructure will be similar to that of the existing Hydra Substation.	
The South African National Roads Agency Limited (SANRAL) has a statutory building line of 60m measured from the road reserve fence, adjacent to the national road.	Ms MJ Runkel: Statutory Control, SANRAL Correspondence: 06.11.2006	Comment acknowledged and forwarded to Eskom.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
9. CONSTRUCTION ISSUES			
Roads must remain as is and no new roads to be constructed.	Marius Esterhuizen: Property Owners, Wynandsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Request noted.	
When will construction start?	Mr Faas, XX: Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006	Should the Competent Authority issue a positive Record of Decision; construction is proposed to begin during May 2007.	
Construction must take place outside of lambing season as the presence of trucks and construction vehicles negatively impacts on his stock and game.	Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted and forwarded to Eskom.	X
Eskom must repair fences if broken during construction and operation.	Frans van der Merwe: Property Owner, Rondavel & Annex Rondawel Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Request noted.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
10. COMMENTS & COMPLAINTS – ESKOM EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE/SERVITUDE			
Environmental Management Plan has not been adhered to.	Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
11. HYDRA-GAMMA 1 RELATED ISSUES			
It was enquired whether the landowners affected by the Hydra-Gamma1 alignment were informed that the alignment had changed from the western side of the exiting power lines to the eastern side.	Mr Molusi: Dept of Tourism, Environment and Conservation KSW: 14.11.2006	The proposed western route alignment was moved to the eastern side on request of the landowners. The Record of Decision received by DEAT for the Hydra-Gamma 1 project was for the western alignment, and the fact that the landowners prefer the eastern alignment needs to be communicated to DEAT.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
12. COMMUNICATION ISSUES			
Requested to be removed from the project database. No comment.	Leon Bradley: Quality & Environmental anagement, Wildlife & Environmental Society of SA E-Mail: 22.11.2006	Requeste noted and removed from database	
Farmers Association may be able to arrange open day for farm worker forum?	Mr Hendrik de Jager: Property Owner, De Put Trust	Comment noted. Contact will be made with the relevant farmers' Association.	
Landowner meeting can be held simultaneously with staff on site.	Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
No contact forum for farm workers – need to conduct farm by farm participation process	Mr Louis de Jager: Property Owner, Klipfontein Boerdery Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	
In response to Bohlweki Environmental’s enquiry regarding a methodology to consult with farm wokers, it was suggested that the local ANC office could be contacted to arrange a labor forum.	Mr A Duthie: Property Owner, Wodehouse Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Suggestion noted.	
	Marius Esterhuizen: Property Owners, Wynandsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
	Frans van der Merwe: Property Owner, Rondavel & Annex Rondawel Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
	Fred Van Zyl: Property Owner, Fred van Zyl Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
Feels that a landowner / stakeholder meeting is warranted.	Mr A Duthie: Property Owner, Wodehouse Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted. A Focus Group Meeting will be arranged.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
	<p>Danny Hugo: Property Owner, Burgersfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Luke Kock: Property Owner, Lemoenkloof Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Pikkie van den Heever: Property Owner, Grootaar CC Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p> <p>Frans van der Merwe: Property Owner, Rondavel & Annex Rondawel Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006</p>		
<p>Are the landowners along the Hydra-Gamma2 proposed route informed/aware of the proposed project?</p>	<p>Mr Faas, XX: Emthanjeni Municipality FGM: 14.11.2006</p>	<p>All the landowners are informed of the proposed Hydra-Gamma2 project. After the Record of Decision was received for Hydra Gamma1, Eskom's Lands and Rights went to negotiate the servitude. During these negotiations, Eskom informed the landowners' that a second 765 kV power line is required between Hydra and Gamma and proceeded to negotiated the second servitude at the same time.</p>	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Are the landowners aware of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) process, which is now being undertaken?		During the double servitude negotiations, the Lands and Rights negotiator informed al the effected landowners that the EIA process was still to follow and would be undertaken, as the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) require this. During the negotiations he further explained that the landowners would have a further opportunity during that EIA process to raise any concerns they may have with regards to the two proposed 765kV power lines.	
The project team was informed that there is a farming community situated on the southern side of the existing Hydra Substation, and commented that they will have to be consulted.		Comment noted. The matter will be assessed and address.	
Requested route corridor map.	Gary Newman: PANS-OPS Specialist, ATS, Civil Aviation Authority E-Mail: 21.11.2006	Request noted and map forwarded.	
Requested that all correspondence regarding the proposed project be directed to him.	Mr Koos Pretorius: Civil Aviation Authority, Inspector CNS, Aerodrome Safety Oversight E-mail: 20.11.2006	Comment noted and confirmed.	
Indicate that a landowners' focus group meeting is not needed.	Piet Schoeman: Property Owner, Niewfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
	Mr RE Venter: Property Owner, Damfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
Are not informed about the current line routing and wants Eskom to consult with him, should he be affected.	Neil Grobelaar: Property Owners, Lovedale Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	It was established that property is not affected by the proposed Hydra-Gamma2 765kV Transmission power line.	
Requested to be registered as an I&AP as he is starting to have a great deal of interest in the SHE fraternity. His interest lies in the knowledge that one will acquire thereof.	Mr Thabo Sefatsa E-mail: 11.11.06	Registered on project database and BID forwarded.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
13. GENERAL COMMENTS AND ISSUES RAISED			
Does not want to grant Eskom access during the rain season as vehicles get stuck in low lying areas and are unable to be retrieved until the ground has dried.	HP Bekker: Property Owners, Elanskuilen Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Concern noted and forwarded to Eskom	
Has no real problem with the proposed line and has not been in the area long.	Mr Louis de Jager: Property Owner, Klipfontein Boerdery Trust Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
No problems and comments.	Johan Esterhuizen: Property Owners, Wynandsfontein & Vlekfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Noted.	
It was requested whether this proposed project would address the black out problems experienced in Cape Town this year.	Mr Martin Fillis, Municipal Manager: Ubuntu Municipality FGM: 15.11.2006	Through Transmission power lines such as this one, Eskom are addressing problems such as those experienced in Cape Town during the course of this year. This project in particular however is more aimed to address the electricity needs required in Port Elizabeth due to the large developments at Coega.	
Would Victoria West be effected in terms of their electricity supply, e.g. experience power failures, due to Eskom addressing electricity needs both at Cape Town and Port Elizabeth.		Victoria West would not be affected in terms of their electricity supply. This proposed project would rather strengthen those networks at Cape Town and Port Elizabeth and would ultimately ensure the electricity supplies at towns such as De Aar and Victoria West are not interrupted.	
The new line has not been determined as of yet and therefore will respond when it has.	Sterrie Marais: Property Owner, Nuwejaarsfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006		
It was enquired whether the proposed Omega Substation has been approved by the decision-making authority.	Mr Molusi: Dept of Tourism, Environment and Conservation KSW: 14.11.2006	A positive Record of Decision has been issued for the Omega Substation project.	
Who and what is the IPP referred to in Eskom's presentation.		IPP refers to <i>Independent Power Producer</i> which is private individuals / companies and are not related to Eskom.	
Have landowners, affected by the proposed new Gamma Substation site, been informed?		The owners permission had be acquired to conduct the EIA and that an EIA for the new site has been submitted to the Western and the Eastern Cape Provincial Departments, respectively.	

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response	To be included in EMP
What will the distance of the closest house be to the proposed Hydra-Gamma2 Transmission power line?		This information is not currently known and that feedback will be provided within the draft Minutes of the meeting. Post meeting note: 40m From the centre line of the power line.	
It was requested that Eskom's vehicles must not ride in the veld and they must remain on the roads.	Frans van der Merwe: Property Owner, Rondavel & Annex Rondawel Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 HP Bekker: Property Owners, Elanskuilen Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006 F J de Vries: Property Owners, Bult & Rietfontein Telephonic Discussion : 15.11.2006	Comment noted.	