

**ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT (EIA) AND ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN (EMP) FOR THE PROPOSED
HENDRINA ASH DAM EXPANSION PROJECT**

COMMENT AND RESPONSES REPORT – FINAL SCOPING REPORT

SUMMARY OF ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES/CONCERNS AND SUGGESTIONS RAISED BY INTERESTED AND/OR AFFECTED PARTIES

MARCH 2011 – August 2011

- This Comments and Responses Report (C&RR) is a record of all the contributed issues raised by Stakeholders ranging across all sectors of society.
- Full record of every issue raised is available from Lidwala Consulting and is also included in Appendix G of the Final Scoping Report (DSR).
- Many stakeholders raised the same issue and these have been arranged into groups of similar issues.
- The name, affiliation (as at that time) and date of the commentator are also indicated.
- The comments under each category have been captured *alphabetically according to surname*.
- Issues raised by technical specialists and Eskom, the project proponent, are not included in the C&RR.

INDEX TO ISSUES IN THIS TABLE

1.	Project Related Comments/ Issues	3
2.	Dust Related Comments/ Issues	3
3.	Water Related Comments/ Issues	3
4.	Water Pipelines Related Comments/ Issues.....	3
5.	Power Line Related Comments/ Issues	4
6.	Technical Related Comments/ Issues.....	4
7.	Relocation Related Comments/ Issues	5
8.	Communication Comments/ Issues	5
9.	General Comments/ Issues	7

ABBREVIATIONS USED IN THIS ISSUES TRAIL:

CV Curriculum Vitae

EAP Environmental Assessment Practitioner

DAFF Department of Agriculture, Forestry & Fisheries

POD Public Open Day

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
1. Project Related Comments/ Issues		
Which dams are going to be expanded as there are five dams mentioned but the two is in operation and the three are having different conditions. If it is ash dam 3, 4 and 5 then what will happen to dam 1 as it has reached full capacity.	Tswai, Dineo Regional Manager (EIM) MDEDET Correspondence: 22 July 2011	The current ash disposal facilities are going to be extended by the establishment of a new ash dam, as a sixth dam. The locations of the alternative sites as identified during the screening study are included within the scoping report. See chapter 3 for more detail on the project description.
2. Dust Related Comments/ Issues		
Where the preferred site is in close proximity to Transnet Freight Rail infrastructure, the impact of ash dust fall out and its deposition on Transnet Freight Rail infrastructure (specifically Overhead Electrical wires) must be investigated and mitigation measures proposed.	Makhubele, Louis Environmental Specialist: Eastern Region Correspondence: 25 July 2011	Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.
3. Water Related Comments/ Issues		
Where the preferred site is in close proximity to Transnet Freight Rail infrastructure and spraying of water on the dam is a possibility, the impact of possible spray drifts towards Transnet Freight Rail overhead electrical wires should be investigated and mitigation measures proposed.	Makhubele, Louis Environmental Specialist: Eastern Region Correspondence: 25 July 2011	Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.
The potential for seepage of contaminated water from the dam onto Transnet Freight Rail property should also be reported.		Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.
The Department would like to know about the water source of the power station.	Tswai, Dineo Regional Manager (EIM) MDEDET Correspondence: 22 July 2011	The Station receives its water from the Nkomati Water Scheme from the Department of Water Affairs.
4. Water Pipelines Related Comments/ Issues		
Where site selection leads to the need for pipes transporting ash to traverse Transnet Freight Rail railway lines, it should be indicated how accidental spillages on Transnet property will be prevented and/or addressed.	Makhubele, Louis Environmental Specialist: Eastern Region Correspondence: 25 July 2011	Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
5. Power Line Related Comments/ Issues		
<p>The need for rerouting of power lines which could lead to power lines crossing over Transnet Freight Rail's infrastructure should be outlined. It should also be noted that Transnet Freight Rail would therefore need to be consulted for approval of crossing overhead wires.</p>	<p>Makhubele, Louis Environmental Specialist: Eastern Region Correspondence: 25 July 2011</p>	<p>Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.</p>
6. Technical Related Comments/ Issues		
<p>In a case where the ash dam is placed in close proximity to the Transnet Freight Rail infrastructure (site E or C), which could lead to significant hydrological changes around Transnet Freight Rail infrastructure, such should be brought to Transnet Freight Rail's attention, to ensure that infrastructure is protected from increased runoff around the area.</p>	<p>Makhubele, Louis Environmental Specialist: Eastern Region Correspondence: 25 July 2011</p>	<p>Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.</p>
<p>The Department would like to know about the sustainability of the project as it have been indicated that the life span of the power station will go up until 2035, will therefore the expansion of the dams have the capacity until to the end of the lifespan of the power station?</p>	<p>Tswai, Dineo Regional Manager (EIM) MDEDET Correspondence: 22 July 2011</p>	<p>The following except has been taken from Chapter 3 of the Scoping report:</p> <p>The need for this extension is to allow the Hendrina Power Station to continue ashing in an environmentally responsible way for the duration of the operating life of the Power Station. The need for the extension is related to the deteriorating coal quality, higher load factors, the installation of the Fabric filter plant (to meet requirements in terms of the National Environmental Management: Air Quality Act (Act 39 of 2004)) and the need to extend station life.</p>
<p>In terms of the related infrastructures such as the expansion of the pipeline, stor water trenches, can you please state the proposed length to be expanded.</p>		<p>Due to the fact that the preferred site has only been identified at the end of the scoping phase and detailed studies are still to be done to confirm this selection – it has not yet been possible to determine the exact length of related infrastructure. This detail will be investigated and proposed during the EIA phase of the project. It is anticipated that in the event the Alternative E is confirmed to be the preferred site, related infrastructure should not exceed 2 – 3 km in length.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
7. Relocation Related Comments/ Issues		
Are people staying around the proposed sites?	Mashioane, Daniel Eskom: Hendrina Power Station POD: 22 July 2011	There are no people staying on any of the alternatives, and definitely not on Alternative E, the EIA recommended site. However, there are people staying near the existing Ash Dams. Therefore as this stage it is not anticipated that any resettlement will be required. Ms Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Eskom has a process in place in the event that this becomes an issue in the future. In the event that any people would have to be relocated for the ash dam, Eskom would comply to approved resettlement processes, which are also recognised by the World Bank. Mr Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Generation
8. Communication Comments/ Issues		
Project team was informed that a hard copy of the final EIA to be submitted to the DAFF for formal review and comment.	Collett, Anneliza Directorate: Land Use and Soil Management DAFF E-mail: 14 July 2011	A copy of the FSR will be submitted to DAFF for comment.
Transnet Freight Rail will provide further comments as and when further investigation reports, for the project, are made available for comments.	Makhubele, Louis Environmental Specialist: Eastern Region Correspondence: 25 July 2011	Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.
Retired from the Environment industry and recommended that we contact Andre Breetge from SANBI's Working for Wetlands as he will be able to provide contact details for the relevant stakeholders.	Schwirzer, Anni E-mail: 15 July 2011	E-mail submitted to SANBI for full contact details to inform SANBI representative regarding the proposed project. Nicolene Venter, SiVEST
The responsible officer is Charity Mthimunye and all correspondence must be directed to: Environmental Impact Manager Section marked for the attention of the responsible officer. Please draw the applicant;s attention to the fact that the activity may not commence prior to an environmental	Tswai, Dineo Regional Manager (EIM) MDEDET Correspondence: 22 July 2011	Comment noted. The project team will make specific note of these issues during the EIA phase.

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
<p>authorisation being granted by the Department.</p>		
<p>It was asked wether the Ekasi news is a Gauteng or Mpumalanga newspaper.</p>	<p>Phaleng, Josephine Eskom: Hendrina Power Station POD: 22 July 2011</p>	<p>It was a Mpumalanga local newspaper. The newspaper was used for the announcement phase of the project. The project team were hoping to use it again for the announcement of the DSR and invitation to the PM, until it was discovered that it no longer exists. Nicolene Venter, SiVEST</p>
<p>What can be done if someone can't e-mail or fax a comment within the allocated time period. Can I&APs leave their comments at a designated area e.g. in the library where the draft report was placed for review?</p>		<p>If there is indeed someone who requires that, then arrangements can be made in order for the project team to get those comments. Nicolene Venter, SiVEST</p> <p>The reason why a "drop box" is not used is that reports and comments have been known to go missing in public places. The project team would rather arrange a more suitable option in the event that an I&AP doesn't have access to a fax or email. Ashlea Strong, Lidwala Environmental</p>
<p>It was asked as to how have the project team has ensured that the community has been notified? At times you find that the project might have an impact on someone or a community and they might not even be aware of what's happening and by the time they do find out about the project it is too late for them to do something about it.</p>	<p>Nkosi, Handson Resident: Pullenshope POD: 22 July 2011</p>	<p>It was reiterating the measures taken to inform the public as mentioned in the presentation such as the site notices, e-mails, newspaper advertisement etc. She also reiterated that there is not a community or resident directly affected i.e. living on the EIA preferred alternative site. Nicolene Venter, SiVEST</p> <p>It was asked if the gentlemen had a proposed strategy on how to better inform the community about the project. He also stated that this was why there is a consultation process. Tobile Bokwe, Eskom Generation No suggestion / recommendation were submitted.</p> <p>Appreciation was expressed for raising the questions because it is through the consultation process that the project team find out how the community interact with each other. It was requested that the discussion regarding the consultation followed be followed up as to provide stakeholders present with an opportunity to raised</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
		<p>questions and that the meeting proceedings are not held up. Nicolene Venter, SiVEST Mr Handson Nkosi accepted this suggestion.</p>
<p>Post-Meeting Discussion: Ms Venter enquired as to what the key concern regarding the consultation process is?</p> <p>Mr Nkosi replied that the concern is that the community was interested, and still is, in a site for a new burial site and the sites being proposed for the newly Hendrina Ash Dam are the same as those that the community was interested in for a new burial site. Both the previous and newly elected Councillor is aware of the process.</p> <p>Mr Daniel Mashiloane joined the discussions and informed Mr Nkosi that the proposed burial sites he is referring to are not close to the proposed Hendrina Ash Dam sites.</p> <p>It was also confirmed that Mr Nkosi did receive notification of the Public Open Day and Public Meeting as well as the various posters that were erected in Pullenshope. And Ms Venter made use of the opportunity to reiterate that I&APs, in terms of NEMA, has a responsibility to inform their neighbours, friends, family and colleagues of the proposed development and who they can contact to obtain more information.</p>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gaan die tender adverteer word? • Indien wel, waar en wanneer? • Gaan voorkeur gegee word aan plaaslike maatskappye in Nkangala/Mpumalanga area? • Gaan hierdie 'n "turnkey" projek wees? <p>Translation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How will the tender process be advertised? • If, where and when? • Will preference be given to local companies in Nkangala/Mpumalanga area? • Will this be a turnkey project? 	<p>Viljoen, Michelle Sales Representative: Mpumalanga ITT Water & Wastewater South Africa (Pty) Ltd Email: 25 July 2011</p>	<p>Tenders will only be advertised (according to the Eskom tendering and supply chain policies) in the event that Eskom does not have the relevant inhouse expertise for a specific aspect of the proposed project. In the event that any aspect of the project goes out to tender Eskom's commercial process will be followed.</p>
<p>9. General Comments/ Issues</p>		
<p>Requested to be registered as an interested and/or affected party, as per advertisement placed in the Rapport on 27 March 2011 and requested a copy of the BID.</p>	<p>Lotter, Anelle Zitholele Consulting E-mail: 28 March 2011</p>	<p>Registration confirmed and BID e-mail.</p>
<p>Advertising services offered to EAP.</p>	<p>Turner, Candic Jonti Tenders</p>	<p>E-mail acknowledged.</p>

Issue/Comment	Raised By	Response
	E-mail: 25 March 2011	
Submitted CV.	Mabango, BJ E-mail: 28 March 2011	CV acknowledged and informed that it was forwarded to Eskom.
	Gericke, Esmeralda E-mail: 28 March 2011	
	Makherana, M E-mail: 29 March 2011	
Submitted information of product services.	Mndebele, Daniel E-mail: 30 March 2011	E-mail acknowledged and information forwarded to Eskom.
Company profile was forwarded to EAP.	Lee, Charmaine Mechanics On Call E-mail: 28 March 2011	E-mail acknowledged and company profile forwarded to Eskom.
	Nhlapo, Theresa Hexonsa (Pty) Ltd E-mail: 03 April 2011	
	De Wet, Madie Highstyle Gifts & Clothing Fax: 06 April 2011	
	Thanduxolo, Makinana Zamoos Trading and Projects Fax: 13 April 2011	