# BRAAMHOEK TRANSMISSION POWER LINE & SUB-STATION INTEGRATION CONSTRUCTION & UPGRADE OF ACCESS ROADS

For the Eskom Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme

# COMMENTS & RESPONSE REPORT (JANUARY 2006): EXTENDED SCOPING REPORT

The various sources of the comments contained in this Comments and Response Report include:

- Records of public, key stakeholder and focus group meetings.
- Comments received by fax, e-mail and mail.
- Transcribed telephone conversations.

All comments received from I&APs as part of the EIA process have been categorised as follows:

#### A. TRANSMISSION POWER LINE AND SUB-STATION INTEGRATION

- 1. Tourism-related issues.
- 2. Agriculture and farming operations.
- 3. Ecological impacts and biodiversity conservation.
- 4. Cultural heritage resource management.
- 5. Social and socio-economic issues.
- 6. Land tenure and compensation.
- 7. Project alternatives and technical queries.

## **B. CONSTRUCTION AND UPGRADE OF ACCESS ROADS**

- 8. Tourism-related issues.
- 9. Agriculture and farming operations.
- 10. Ecological impacts and biodiversity conservation.
- 11. Cultural heritage resource management.
- 12. Social and socio-economic issues.
- 13. Land tenure and compensation.
- 14. Job creation and economic opportunities.
- 15. Project alternatives.
- 16. Technical queries and comments.

### C. ISSUES APPLICABLE TO BOTH PROJECTS

- 17 (a) EIA Process (technical).
- 17 (b) EIA Process (public participation).
- 18. Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme.
- 19. Eskom Distribution Queries
- 20. Other queries and comments.
- 1. The project team has tried to reflect as accurately as possible, the issues raised by I&APs. Should you feel that your issues are not accurately captured or have been placed under the incorrect category, please contact the Public Participation Office.
- 2. "Unidentified stakeholders" refer largely to persons who attended meetings and verbally raised issues without the project team managing to capture their name. This in no way diminishes the value of the issue raised. Should you recognise your issue and would like to have your name recorded next to it, please contact the Public Participation Office.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
A. TRANSMISSION	POWER LINE AND SUB-STATION INTEGRATION	
1. Tourism-related issu	ues	
Mr Louis van Wyk Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality	The study area under consideration is pristine in terms of tourist attractions. The differences between overhead and underground Transmission Power Line alternatives have not been made clear. Have these alternatives been investigated? Underground Power Lines have short-term impacts, whilst overhead Power Lines have long-term impacts particularly in terms of visual impacts.	Appendix 5 of the Power line and substation integration Scoping Report.  There are various reasons for Transmission Power Lines not to go

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr W Bekker Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife	This memorandum serves to outline the involvement of Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife in the Weenen-Umsuluzi project.	These issues also relate to Issue Category 3 (ecological issues).
	Umsuluzi, Matontwane and the Weenen Game Reserves are directly affected by a number of Gazetted Land Claims in the Greater Weenen District.	
	The Regional Lands Claims Commissioner (RLCC) is currently adopting a holistic approach in settling the claims, as the land use on all above mentioned properties is conservation based. The larger the area, the more economically viable it will be.	
	The project aims to see EKZNW managing the biodiversity components of the Umsuluzi Game Park in the near future. This immediately forges a partnership between private landowners, RLCC and EKZNW. It provides an opportunity to develop a role model for economic sustainability through participative management of a joint ownership venture. This model will be the first of its kind in the Province and have full support of the RLCC.	
	Ultimately it is the intention to expand this project to include additional land under conservation use North of the R74.	
2. Agriculture and farm	ing operations	
Mr Earl (CE) Leathern Vizitrade Seven Pty Ltd	Owns Farms: Bloemhoek, Kranskloof, Strasmore & Berglaagte. All his farms have powerlines across them. One of the Majuba-Venus lines crosses his farms.	Noted, see below.
Mr Gary Raymond Green	Issues and concerns raised are part of submission from the Ladysmith and District Farmers Association.	
Mr Hylton Green Green H Ranches CC	Issues and concerns raised are part of a submission from the Ladysmith and District Farmers Association.	Noted, see below.

NAME &	HOEK PUMPED STORAGE SCHEME	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	
Mr RA Lees <i>on behalf of the</i> Ladysmith & District Farmers Association	I have been instructed by the Executive Committee to write to you. It is the view of the Executive Committee that whilst representations made to landowners prior to the erection of Power Lines indicate that Eskom have the best interests of landowners at heart, in practice once the Power Lines have been erected Eskom has proven itself to be a 'bad neighbour'.	entire letter has been placed within this category for the sake of continuity.
	<ul> <li>The problems which landowners encounter with Eskom generally involve the following issues:</li> <li>Minimal assistance with fighting veld fires, many of which are started by Eskom equipment.</li> <li>A refusal on the part of Eskom to accept responsibility for damages believed to be caused by problems with Eskom equipment. These include fire damage to grazing, livestock losses and even loss of human life.</li> <li>The lack of maintenance on gates, roads etc. which are established by Eskom for their Power Lines which are erected on private property.</li> <li>The lack of any action when the so-called 'call centre' is contacted. Names and contact details of responsible and locally based persons not being made known to landowners in order for problems to be solved swiftly.</li> </ul>	operations related. They do not have direct bearing on this EIA study. Indirectly, however, there is a concern that unless the issues are addressed, any new line will be generating similar problems with associated environmental impacts. This matter is addressed in more detail in the main report, Section 7.  It is also understood that the matter has been taken to a high level within Eskom and a subsequent meeting has been held with the Ladysmith Farmers Association (this being outside the scope of the EIA). At the time of writing, actions arising from this meeting are still being carried out.
	In particular the Executive Committee is deeply disturbed by the position adopted by Eskom in regard to damage claims from members of the Association. There are two claims, which remain unresolved.	
	The first of these claims concerns Mr HR Green of Green H Ranches (a past President of this Association) who had a devastating fire sweep through his farm and through the housing village for his staff. We are informed that a member of the Association is witness to the fact that this fire was ignited by sparks which resulted from an Eskom Power Line pole falling. Many members of the Association had to fight this fire throughout the night without any assistance from Eskom. Four people burnt to death during this fire and extensive damage was done. We understand that Eskom has refused to accept liability and the matter has now been referred to High Court.	
	The second claim concerns the electrocution of 7 head of cattle belonging to Mr MG Green. We are informed that these cattle were electrocuted when an Eskom Power Line fell to ground level as a result of another fallen Power Line pole. We understand that in this case there has again been refusal by Eskom to accept responsibility and Mr MG Green has been forced to take legal action.	
	The Association is surprised that Eskom appears not to have insurance cover for its liability arising in cases such as those that are described above. Indeed the impression created is that Eskom simply does not care.	
	The Executive Committee has therefore recommended to the members of the Association that they refuse to co-operate with Eskom or its representatives in regards to the proposed 400 kV Power Line for the proposed Braamhoek Power Station. Any future co-operation would be dependent upon agreement being reached with regards to the claims described above.	
	This correspondence was also copied to Mr MG Green, HR Green, Carol Streaton (Eskom Transmission) & Pieter Steenkamp (Eskom Transmission).	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Theunis de Jager Theunis de Jager Trust	Power Lines and poles must not cross any agricultural land that is used for crops.	Noted. The proposed Turn-in route and Braamhoek-Venus line has been routed to avoid the areas identified by the landowner.
	Obtain landowners permission to access their property.	The ECO and Contractor will liase with the Landowners for access prior to entering the property.
	The bridge to cross the Klipriver must be wide enough to carry wide implements i.e. combine harvesters (approx 8m).	
Mr Malcolm George Green Green Ranches CC	Mr Green mentioned that an old Eskom line killed livestock and he is presently involved in a court case with Eskom and is not interested in negotiating.	Noted. It is understood that Eskom has subsequently been in contact with Mr Green. The details of the matter are <i>sub judicae</i> .
Mr Nigel Winston Ralfe Doornkop Farm	Does not want the line to go through his farm due to potential decline in value of the land.  Complaints from previous construction include the following:  Gates left opened and livestock let through fences.  Waste left around – nuts, bolts, wires, etc.  Theft, safety and security issues during construction as well as maintenance of the line.  Also concerned about cattle grazing under powerlines.	Land values: This is a complex issue that is dependent on a number of factors including land use and presence of other infrastructure. An existing 400kV line is already present on Mr Ralfe's land and a vacant servitude runs parallel to it. Land values are the focus of the servitude establishment process, and an independent valuator is appointed.
Mr Graham BD McIntosh	Adequate compensation for servitudes.	Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
Mr Allan Jeremy Green	Feel it is unfair to propose an additional powerline since Eskom has at least three servitudes across their farm already.	
Mr Norman R Tratschler	Objects to additional powerlines on his properties due to Eskom's negligence. In the past gates were left open when Eskom was working on his property, also wires were left lying around within his farm.	
Mr Hilton Henry Davie Kwanalu-Ondini District Agriculture Council	Hopes Eskom does not put another powerline on his farm.	Noted.
Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	The Project Team needs to consider that farmers are in a state of uncertainty due to a number of factors e.g. land redistribution, drought, etc.	Noted.
Shabalala Traditional Authority and Matiwaneskop Farmers Association	There is intensive livestock farming in the area. Theft of livestock is a potential issue.	Noted. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
Mthembu Traditional Authority	During construction, safety of livestock needs to be prioritised. It is only occasionally that herdsmen look after their livestock. It is a common practice for herdsmen to let cattle off their "isibaya" in the morning for grazing and fetch them in the afternoon.	Noted. See above.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Ladysmith and District Farmers Association	Landowners felt that there is gross unfairness in terms of Eskom expecting landowners to challenge decisions in Court. In addition, landowners are expected to carry the cost of the appeal. As soon as there are problems or an appeal, farmers always lose because they do not have sufficient financial capacity to fight Eskom.	It is understood that Eskom prefers to avoid court action and there should first be a thorough investigation of any complaints. It appears this is the root of the problems reported, and it is understood Eskom is addressing this situation.
	Mr Alan Green stated that he has experienced problems with Eskom's billing system. He explained that it took 3 years for Eskom to pay back to him R30 000 that he had been overcharged. In a number of occasions it has been Eskom's unilateral decisions that have affected landowners.	The details of this case are outside of the scope of this study.
	Mr Hylton Green stated that at some stage there was a fire on properties, on which there were Eskom Power Lines, and 4 people were burnt to death on one of the farms. There are 3 Power Lines running through his farm and a substation next to his neighbour. The costs associated with Eskom's infrastructure on properties are exorbitant and farmers are expected to carry them without any assistance whatsoever from Eskom.	As above, the details of this case are outside of the scope of this study. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
	Eskom does not accept responsibility for damages, which have been caused by Eskom Power Lines. Farmers have claims where livestock has been killed next to Power Lines and these have not been met by Eskom. Farmers believe that Power Lines attract lightning.	Lightning issues – Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report Reports of damage must be made to the Regional Manager (see Section 7 of the main report). It is recommended that claims must be made in writing and sent by registered post. Any reported damage due to Eskom facilities or infrastructure should be investigated by Eskom. The details of the decision
	It was indicated that Eskom has become a faceless entity and farmers cannot get a response from Eskom. An example was stated of one landowner who has notified Eskom on numerous occasions of gates that needed to be fixed. Eskom has neither responded nor fixed the gates and to date the farmer concerned has replaced ±6 of Eskom's gates.	should be reported to the complainant.  It is understood that Eskom is looking into the specific situation in this area.
	It was stated that previously Eskom told farmers that because they already have 3 Power Lines on their properties, Eskom would not put another line through their properties.	The origin of this is difficult to investigate. There is no written commitment for this. Instead, landowners along the Majuba-Venus I & II lines signed an extra servitude agreement with Eskom.
	Mr Piet Schoeman mentioned that in the past years, there was a useful Government Liaison Officer that was stationed in the area. Farmers had success in dealing with their problems due to the effectiveness of this Liaison Officer. The current process is completely different and now no assistance whatsoever is available.	Noted. This proposal has been passed on to Eskom.
	Farmers stated that they have read articles, which indicate that Eskom currently spends a lot less on maintenance than they used to. Eskom does not maintain distribution lines. Eskom is more interested in making profits than taking care of their Power Lines.	It is understood from Eskom that there is no policy for reducing maintenance budgets. Maintenance budgets are reviewed annually. Any concerns relating to poor maintenance should be reported, preferably in writing, to the regional manager.
	Does Eskom have Fire Protection Systems so they can receive warnings of fire? Eskom does not help with fighting fires.	Eskom has an early warning fire system. Eskom does not fight fires. Eskom does not have the capacity to fight fires. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Ladysmith and District Farmers Association Continued	Eskom uses roads within farmers' properties yet farmers do their own maintenance. Eskom use farmers' infrastructure, which they have to put in at their own cost. Eskom should consider paying rental or a service fee to take care of costs incurred.	
	Stringing needs to be better managed as it impacts negatively on maize farms during construction of Transmission Lines.	Agreed. The stringing process is potentially one of the more damaging construction activities. However, compensation should be paid out for crop damage.
	Mr Hylton Green stated that if Eskom was a good neighbour, farmers would be more amenable to them. The problem is that Eskom is a bad neighbour.	Noted. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
Colenso Farmers Association	There is extensive orange farming in the area. Centre pivots are used for crop irrigation.	Noted.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Graham Hutton Atkinson	Regarding ACER telephone conversation regarding the proposed Braamhoek 400kV Transmission Power Line which could possibly effect my property namely "Kopleegte" Farm No.00001154 Sub-Division No. 0007.	Noted.
	I hereby inform you that I am NOT prepared to have yet another Eskom Power line cross my property for the following reasons.	Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
	<ol> <li>I already have Power Lines crossing my adjoining farms and Kopleegte. These lines already represent a danger to my livestock and grazing. In the past 4 years, I have twice found the live lines lying on the ground caused by poles breaking off. These cause serious danger of Electrocution to my cattle and also a fire hazard. It is only by a miracle that no cattle were electrocuted on these occasions.</li> <li>During February 1997, I had a number of cattle electrocuted by an Eskom Line, which came down as a result of a rotten pole on my farm Thornlands. Eskom refused to pay me out for the loss of my livestock, which included my bull – Eskom made many excuses despite the fact that the contract stated that Eskom would pay for damage caused by Eskom infrastructure.</li> <li>During November 1999, the same line toppled again due to the collapse of three (3) completely rotten poles, which were supporting the line. Fortunately no livestock were lost but a tractor driver nearly drove into the live lines across our farm roads.</li> <li>I hereby inform you that I am completely against having a 400kV Power line Crossing my property, the reason being:         <ul> <li>Alvaing a 400kV Power Line on ones property reduces the value of the farm and also makes my farm more difficult to sell should one decide to sell at a later stage.</li> <li>The magnetic field caused by heavy lines interferes with the fertility and breeding cycles of cattle within camps where these lines cross the farms, especially if the camps are long and narrow where the Power Lines traverse the property.</li> <li>The lines would also interfere with the fallow agricultural lands should they be incorporated at a later stage. Towers also block pivot circles, etc.</li> <li>Kopleegte has dams, which dry up during droughts, and it may be necessary to drill more boreholes and these could be prevented by overhead lines. Underground water is not plentiful and Kopleegte seems to be the most likely</li></ul></li></ol>	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Besters Farmers Association	Landowners have experienced problems with Eskom contractors during construction and have nowhere to report their issues and complaints. There are numerous cases where contractors have caused damage and Eskom failed to respond to any of the farmers' complaints.	did not fix them afterwards. Landowners throughout the country experience
		Eskom requested landowners to put their complaints in writing as it is much easier to deal with a written complaint.
		During construction there will be a Site Supervisor and an Environmental Control Officer and they are on site every day. After the finalisation of servitude negotiations, landowners will be provided with contact details of the Site Inspector as well as the Environmental Control Officer, this will ensure that landowners are able to contact them. They will be within a distance of 80km, therefore they should be able to respond to landowners. The ECO will make sure that all the Landowner's special conditions are met and the rehabilitation of the site has been done during and after construction.
		The landowner is expected, at the end of construction, to "sign off the servitude documentation". In this document, a landowner needs to indicate that he is happy with the work that has been undertaken within his land. A landowner is not expected to sign off the documents if he still has outstanding issues.
		Eskom Transmission will not be able to hand over a Transmission Power Line to the region that needs to maintain the Transmission Power Line if landowners concerned have not signed off the documentation.
		The Draft Scoping Report (DSR) will contain recommendations from the Study Team on procedures to be followed. As an example, in the case of Besters Farmers Association, findings include that contractors are not meeting construction requirements during construction of Power Lines.
		The Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT) will attach conditions on the Record of Decision based on the findings contained in the DSR compiled by the Consultant.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Besters Farmers Association continued	Farmers indicated that it does not matter whether issues and/or concerns are for Transmission or Distribution, Eskom should have "public liability".	Eskom does carry public liability. However, each case should be investigated. Landowners are encouraged to report damages, etc. in writing to the Regional Managers (Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report).
	How can farmers prove negligence on Eskom's side? Farmers have numerous problems, especially as they do not have the comparable resources available to prove that Eskom was negligent. Conversely, Eskom has all the facts and can defend themselves to their advantage.	
	Eskom is a multibillion industry while a farmer has not even a fraction of the power of a multibillion industry. Landowners are only governed by the Fire Protection Act (Act No 101 of 1998). Fires affect farmers instantly and no recourse is passed on.	
	Eskom needs to acknowledge that Farmers own the land. Irrespective of how many problems Farmers experience, Eskom does not care, and is a "bad neighbour". Once	required in terms of legislation.
	landowners have signed, Eskom forgets about them. Landowners are asking for a change in Eskom's attitude. Also if a claim has been refused, landowners need to understand the reasons for refusal and the approach adopted in dealing with the case.	Noted. This matter is being addressed by Eskom in the regional offices.
	Farmers are not skilled and some do not know, for example, what insulators are. In this regard, farmers questioned how Eskom can expect a farmer to prove that an insulator or any part of the Transmission Power Line was not up to the required standard, also farmers do not know in what position and/or condition it is supposed to be, for safety purposes or to prevent fires. Farmers are fighting a brick wall because Eskom knows what is wrong or right and they can defend themselves because they know the facts and farmers do not. Farmers only deal with agricultural related activities and not with Power Lines.	Noted. See above.
	One of the farmers indicated that, as an example, one of Eskom's contractors recently cut down some trees on his farm and left them lying on site.	
	What would happen if wood is left lying on site and a fire starts? The fire would spread rapidly through the dry trees on the ground resulting in damages to the Power Line and the landowner will be held responsible.	The servitude agreement with Eskom provides for Eskom to cut down the trees under the Power Lines. The trees still belong to the landowner and Eskom cannot remove them from the site. This would be removal of property which does not belong to Eskom. The removal can only be done with the permission of the landowner. If lightning strikes the pole and the pole sets the grass or veld alight, Eskom will not pay because it is nature's cause. However, if it is proven that it is due to Eskom's negligence that the pole sets the grass or velds alight,
	Every year, the Farmers within the Besters District are responsible for burning a certain section of the area. Mr Henderson can assist the Project Team by indicating the boundaries of the firebreak of the Besters Farmers Association on the study area maps.	then Eskom will pay.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Besters Farmers Association continued	Do Power Lines affect cattle's productivity?	Extensive studies have been done on the potential effect of Electro Magnetic Fields (EMFs) or Electro Magnetic Radiation on people and livestock and nothing has been proven yet. Research remains inconclusive that there is a statistical link between EMFs from Power Lines and any ill health of people or animals living under them. However, Eskom adopts a precautionary principle to this matter. Eskom Transmission does not allow people to live within the servitude. The servitude width is set such that EMF levels drop below internationally acceptable standards outside the servitude boundary. Health risks to humans or animals passing under the lines are considered to be negligible. Furthermore, Eskom receives updates on the latest developments about EMFs. For a 400kV line, a distance of 27.5m from the centre of the Power Line to the beginning of the domestic house is allowed. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report 7.
3. Ecological impacts	and biodiversity conservation	
Ms Dinesree Thambu Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife (EKZNW)	It is brought to your attention that EKZNW has identified biodiversity issues of potentially significant concern. Unfortunately, given current staffing constraints and the fact that EKZNW's Planning Division will be operating a skeleton staff over the month of December, we will not be able to be in a position to provide official comments on these issues until early 2005. We will endeavour to provide you with EKZNW's report(s) as soon as possible.  Please direct any queries in this regard to the Co-ordinator IEM (033 845 1346).	
Mr W Bekker Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife	Refer to Mr Bekker's input under Issue Category 1 (tourism).	Refer to the response to Mr Bekker's input under Issue Category 1 (tourism).
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	What are the impacts on the virgin land within the study area? This must be addressed in the EIA in association with Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife.	Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report.  An Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife representative was present at the Key Stakeholder Workshop and formal submission has been promised by EKZNW (see rows above).  It is relevant to note here that specialist studies for Transmission infrastructure are adapted to suit the linear nature of the development and the limited footprint. Furthermore, the specialist studies for the Braamhoek-Venus 400kV line were even further refined given the presence of vacant servitudes and parallel 400kV lines along substantial sections of the study area.

NAME &	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION		
Mr Angus Burns Ekangala Grassland Trust	An extensive faunal survey has been conducted which could be of great benefit for both components of study. This information is available freely to both project teams. Please contact me for further information.	The main faunal impacts arise in crossing grasslands that support powerline sensitive bird species – cranes, bustards, etc. A specialist Avifauna study (Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report) has been undertaken in this regard and has used the grassland studies mentioned. For other fauna impacts Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report. Also see comments above.
Skeurklip Conservancy and Farm Owner	Will bird life be taken into consideration?	Yes. A specialist avifauna study was undertaken. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
Farmers Association	Messrs Earl Leathern, Garry Green and Hylton Green indicated that the farm called Kraanskloof has the highest Blue Crane and Crown Crane population during the winter months. Mortalities of both Blue Crane and Crown Crane are huge due to Power Lines in the area. Power Lines need to be marked.	This information has been forwarded to Mr Chris van Rooyen and Mr. Kevin McCaan of Endangered Wildlife Trust who is an Avifauna Specialist
	There is no accountability from Eskom. Who should take responsibility for Eskom's negligence? Eskom does whatever they want because they are power suppliers. At some stage Eskom cut down an Acacia Siberana, which was $\pm 4m$ tall.	Eskom indicated that such an incident should not have happened. Ms Streaton undertook to report this matter to the transmission staff responsible for the maintenance of the Power Line. During construction of the new Power Line indigenous trees that did not pose a threat to the Power Line would be identified, marked and protected.
	One of the issues that should be of concern is the soil in Mt Royal Conservancy, which is highly erodable. Also there are a number of ecologically sensitive areas within the study area, which are not being mentioned.	Information on the ecologically sensitive areas was requested. Many of the areas are seen to be erosion sensitive and will require careful construction and placement of access roads – in particular access across upland wetlands (small wetlands on valley slopes.).
		Drainage outlets will be designed to limit erosion.
Besters Farmers Association	Who is responsible for access roads during construction of a Transmission Line? If Eskom makes a road they should maintain it.	Eskom should repair any roads they damage during construction or maintenance of the line. Landowners must 'sign off' repairs for any damage caused during construction before Eskom will let the contractor leave the site. Roads used only for access to Eskom infrastructure should be maintained by Eskom.
Shabalala Traditional Authority and Matiwaneskop Farmers Association	Soil erosion is a problem in some of the Matiwaneskop areas. Measures to minimise erosion during construction should be implemented.	Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report.
4. Cultural heritage reso	purce management	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Gabriel Tlhapi South African Heritage Resources Agency	Please note that the South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA) may require a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) in terms of Section 38 of the National Heritage Resources Act, No. 25 of 19999 if it is not already required by another Act. If an evaluation of the impact of the development is required in terms of another act, such as the Environmental Conservation Act, 1989, an evaluation of the impact of the development on heritage resources must fulfil the requirements of the SAHRA in terms of Subsection (3) of Section 38 of the National Heritage Resources Act. In view of the above we require that a qualified archaeologist be appointed to identify and assess potential archaeological sites and material, as well as other heritage resources, such as graves and buildings older than 60 years that may be affected by the proposed development. This report must contain, as a minimum, the information specified in Section 38 (3) of the National Heritage Resources Act.	appointed to undertake a heritage and archaeological assessment.
Ms Karen van Ryneveld Amafa aKwaZulu-Natali	No complete Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) has been done in the particular area. Amafa aKwaZulu-Natali would require a HIA to be done by an Amafa accredited CRM specialist in terms of Section 27 (1) (a) and 27 (1) (c) (v) of the KwaZulu-Natal Heritage Act, No 10 of 1997.  Note that the HIA may be done after finalization of the exact location of the sub-division, line and access road.  NB: This submission contained a list of Amafa accredited CRM specialists.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr McEdward Murimbika Institute for Cultural Resource Management	The Institute for Cultural Resource Management (ICRM) is an accredited institution responsible for Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), Mitigation and Monitoring; Heritage Resources Management Planning and Cultural Resources Management Policing.	A specific study approach has been adopted for power line HIAs. An initial HIA is undertaken to assist the routing of the power line then a more detailed survey and assessment is done when the first tower locations are provided. This is usually after the Record of Decision.
	As such, the ICRM is interested in providing the HIA services as part of the EIA process recently announced. Furthermore, we would like to view the results of such a study in order for us to capture them in our database and to mark off areas that are archaeologically surveyed for subsequent studies or impact considerations.	
	Please note that our interests are service provision and research. The Heritage Authorities, the Amafa KwaZulu-Natali and the Heritage Council and the SAHRA are the compliance agencies in terms of the KwaZulu-Natal Heritage Act, (Act No. 10 of 1997) and National Heritage Resources Act, (Act no 25 of 1999).	
	The Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment should make provision for both the physical cultural properties, such as archaeological sites, as well as the intangible heritage (e.g. socio – cultural practices that may be impacted upon by the shift in the <i>status quo</i> ).	
	As part of the EIA, the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment should be structured in such a way that it captures impacts on physical cultural sites as well as assessing the impacts on potential intangible heritage resources such as community practices or socio-cultural values attached to both the bio-physical and human environments that may be affected (negatively or positively) by the proposed developments.	avoid sites of cultural significance. Towers can easily be relocated to av- grave sites, middens, stonewalls, etc. Places of cultural significance have be
	During the cultural impact assessment (specialist study) there is only a 50% chance of finding resources prior to construction. During construction, there is a concern that cultural heritage resources will be discovered. Are these circumstances planned for in the Environmental Management Plan (EMP), i.e. chance find situations? Procedures need to be outlined clearly in the EMP.	issues. The point about additional finds during construction is relevant. Contractors should be trained and this should be included in the EMP.
5. Social and socio-eco	onomic issues	
Mr Dirk J Vermeulen Emnambithi Local Municipality	Importance of social-economic impacts - stay in the Ladysmith area. Social part of the Environmental Impact Assessment needs to be prioritised.	A specialist social impact assessment was undertaken
Mr Malcolm George Green Green Ranches CC	His brother, Hylton Green had a fire on his farm that killed two people.	This issue is seen to relate more to servitude management and fire fighting. See earlier comments.
Mr Nigel Winston Ralfe Doornkop Farm	Eskom needs to maintain the construction camps properly.	Agreed. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report .

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	Eskom is a 'giant' company and operates in areas where communities are poor. Eskom has a corporate social investment programme. How do you ensure that local people benefit from these developments?	Eskom has programmes for the upliftment of people and policies that take the local people into account. During 2004, approximately 50% of contracts were awarded to BEE Contractors. Eskom has a Development Foundation and when communities are in need, an application is submitted to the Eskom Development Foundation. The foundation decides on how communities can be assisted. Also, the electrification programme is currently on line and 70% of the population now has access to electricity as a result of that process.
Mayor Gaba Makhathini Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality	We have poor communities around the area who cannot grasp the aspects of business. The issue of poverty needs to be addressed and the key question is 'have the surrounding communities been catered for within the development plan?' Eskom's business plan should reflect this.	Eskom's planning is undertaken at different levels, initially divided into Power Generation, Transmission (National Grid), and Distribution (local supply). It is the Distribution planning that will have the most relevance to the planning and development of individual communities. This project is at Generation and Transmission level and considers more the national requirement of electricity supply.
Mr Enoch Mazibuko Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	In terms of job creation, does Eskom only focus on the study area, or are other areas considered too? What will local benefits include?	Eskom needs to consider the type of work being done in the construction process. For example, bush clearing may be an opportunity for local contractors. The service provided by contractors is the most important criteria. During construction, there will be spin-off benefits for the local community, including retail, catering, equipment and supplies.
Mr RA Lees <i>on behalf of the</i> Ladysmith & District Farmers Association	Some of the issues raised by the Ladysmith and District Farmers Association are of a social nature (e.g. loss of human life and safety). As these were raised together with issues relating to agricultural practices within one letter, please refer Mr Lees' letter under Issue Category 2 (Agriculture).	See corresponding response to Mr Lees' letter under Issue Category 2 (Agriculture).
Ms Cebisile Chonco Community Environmental Workers (CEW) Trust	Can transmission Power Lines avoid going over homesteads/houses? What is the recommended distance between houses and the transmission Power Lines?	The recommended distance is 27.5 metres from the centre point to the edge of the servitude. There are international concerns regarding electro-magnetic fields that could affect the health of humans and animals. For safety purposes, Eskom has calculated that the effect of this field would be almost within internationally accepted standards outside of the servitude. Thus, houses must be relocated outside this area. There is no conclusive evidence that this electro-magnetic field is harmful. Eskom, however adopts a precautionary principle. Therefore in most cases Eskom prefers to avoid houses and homesteads and the line will be diverted to avoid them if possible. However, if houses have encroached into vacant servitudes, then Eskom will ask the occupants to move.
Mthembu Traditional Authority	Poverty is an issue in the area since a number of residents are without jobs. The Mthembu Traditional Authority Office should be notified should there be opportunities for employment during construction, operation and/or maintenance of the Transmission Power Line.	Noted. Emnambithi have also made a specific request in this regard. Eskom is encouraged to liaise with community representatives (municipalities, traditional authorities, etc.) prior to construction to establish local capacity.
	Issues specifically related to construction camps will be discussed with the Project Team and Eskom once a preferred route has been identified. Therefore, a meeting will need to be arranged in this regard.	Noted. Eskom and the Contractor will negotiate for a campsite with the Landowner and/or affected community.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Shabalala Traditional Authority and	Projects that will directly or indirectly benefit the communities are welcomed.	Noted.
	What can Eskom provide for the communities apart from compensation? Eskom should look at some ways of assisting communities, for example, areas without proper school buildings, potable water, etc.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	Clarity was requested on the issue of poverty alleviation and employment opportunities that will be available during the construction of the Transmission Power Line.	There are limited opportunities for employment during construction of the Transmission Power Lines. Due to the specialised nature of the required skills, opportunities are mainly restricted to bush clearing, trench digging, provision of local services (e.g. catering), etc.
	The construction camps need to be located close to amenities. No specific sites were mentioned.	Eskom should liaise with local authorities prior to location of construction camps.
	Is there a programme for sensitising communities against negative social impacts?	Eskom is going to embark on an AIDS/HIV awareness campaign to communities. It was agreed that it would seem appropriate that this be coordinated through Emnambithi structures and that it should be done prior to construction.
	How many people can be expected on a construction camp at once?	Up to 120 construction workers are anticipated at any one time for the Transmission Power Line construction. This will vary during the construction programme.
	Eskom and the Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality should investigate construction materials and/or activities that could be sourced locally.	Noted. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
	Requested Eskom to provide a list of material that will be required for construction, including lists of manual labour. This information will be shared with the local Chamber of Business so that they can let businesses know of opportunities for providing material, etc.	Noted. This request has been forwarded to Eskom.
	Mr Vermeulen emphasised that you cannot bring people from another area to work in Ladysmith – this is a reality and Eskom needs to be sensitive. Local people have to be used as much as possible.	Noted. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report
	Eskom should look at the possibility of designing the construction camp in a manner that is sensitive to the immediate environments' needs. This includes considering structures that could be easily turned into a positive impact after construction. Lessons could be learnt from the construction of the Gariep Dam. Reference was more towards the PSS construction.	construction camps are always of a temporary nature. The construction campsites would be rehabilitated completely after use. This suggestion is more
	Councillor Reddy indicated that in Van Reenen there are a number of properties, which are under-utilised that were left behind by Propnet.	Noted.
	Where possible, existing facilities should be used both for construction of the Transmission Power Line as well as Access Roads to the lower and upper reservoirs. Such facilities could be upgraded, possibly for water supply, etc.	Noted and agreed.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Ladysmith and District Farmers Association	When Eskom built the last Transmission Power Line the incidents of HIV/AIDS in the area rose markedly. Therefore it is necessary to have tight security in the construction camp area.	Agreed. Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report .
Besters Farmers Association	What will happen to the construction camps, will they remain or be permanent structures? Is there going to be a construction village as in Drakensville? If so, what will the issues be around it?	
	Eskom must take note of the fact that this is a high fire risk area. High winds are common and fighting fires is a very serious and difficult task. Fire breaks are planned at a district level, and there are section responsibilities for each landowner.	Noted. See previous comments and Please refer to the Power line and Substation integration Scoping Report. Eskom as a landowner will become a member of the Fire Protection Agency as required in terms of legislation.
	How is Eskom going to support this? Eskom needs to employ fire management methods in order to manage fires. Is there any process that Eskom is using to monitor fires?	Eskom does not fight fires. Eskom does not have the capacity to fight fires. It is dangerous to fight fires underneath the Power Lines. However, Eskom has an early warning fire system, which identifies potential fires. See Section 7.4 of the main report.
Shabalala Traditional Authority and Matiwaneskop Farmers Association	Potential increase in crime due to construction camps in the area.  Poverty reduction is a priority for the Matiwaneskop Traditional Authority. Should there be opportunities for communities, the Traditional Authority Office and Development Committees should be informed and involved in the process.	
	There are a number of graves in the area and they should be avoided during construction.	Noted.
Abantungwa-kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authorities	There is a high rate of unemployment in the Abantungwa-Kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authority areas.	See comments above.
	Employment opportunities should be communicated with the relevant Traditional Authority Offices so that potential conflict amongst local residents is avoided.	
	There are a number of graves in the area and they should be avoided during construction.	
	The location of construction camps should be discussed in detail once the final route has been identified and if it affects them.	

NAME &	MHOEK PUMPED STORAGE SCHEME	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	
Amanteshe Traditional Authority	Location of construction camps needs to be decided upon with the Amanteshe Traditional Authority if their area will be affected.	
	There is a high rate of unemployment in the area. Should there be any opportunities for employing local people, Inkosi Zondi should be informed accordingly.	
	Potential increase in Sexually Transmitted Diseases due to influx of strangers in the area.	
	Safety of communities where the proposed Transmission Power Line will be constructed should be considered.	
	The Roosboom area has a population of approximately 3000 people.	
	Eskom needs to respect that some days, for example, Saturdays are allocated for funerals. However, this does not mean that construction work should not continue, it means that Eskom needs to be sensitive.	
	There is no potable water in the area. A provision will have to be made for workers within the Construction Camps.	
	There is shortage of schools. Learners have to walk long distances to go to schools; therefore safety of learners during construction becomes an issue.	
6. Land tenure and cor		
Mr Maxwell Shabalala Matiwaneskop Farmers Association	The Matiwaneskop is a free hold area - broken away from the Traditional Authority land.	Noted.
Nkosi NB Shabalala Shabalala TA & Emnambithi Regional Authority	Taking into consideration that ownership of land will remain with the original owner is appreciated.	Noted.
Besters Farmers Association	What happens if people decide to build underneath the servitude?	The conditions of establishment of servitudes preclude certain activities, including the building of houses. Eskom will approach the landowner should people start building underneath the Transmission Power Line and request that the buildings be removed. Eskom only has Authority to build or construct a Power Line within a specified servitude. The land still remains the responsibility of the landowner/farmer. Therefore, Eskom will liaise with landowners regarding removal of houses in the servitude. Each case will be treated on merit.
	What compensation would Eskom pay for a farm?	Eskom pays 100% value of the land for veld, cropping, grazing, etc. therefore, Eskom compensates the value of the servitude width. Eskom does not take ownership of the land. Eskom only acquires the servitude right. If buildings have to be moved, Eskom gets a valuator to calculate the actual value to be paid to the owner. Compensation rates also take into consideration cases where a landowner cannot utilise his land due to fire hazards, falling trees, etc.
	The servitude document is a "legal document" which binds Eskom and the landowner. This document should highlight all the issues and conditions of signing for the servitude.	Noted.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Shabalala Traditional Authority and Matiwaneskop Farmers	Compensation should be done fairly and reasonably and should be irrespective of the land use type.	Noted.
Association	Should there be a need for resettlement, compensation rates should be the same irrespective of type of material used for houses.	See comments above. Eskom will usually replace a house with a structure of similar size and value, but each case is assessed separately.
	<ol> <li>Land in Matiwaneskop is divided into two:</li> <li>Matiwaneskop Syndicate: There are 120 landowners (original landowners) with Title Deeds. There are Trustees that are authorised to act as custodians on behalf of all landowners and their descendants in respect of the unclaimed portions of land at the farm Matiwaneskop No. 1393. Some members of the Matiwaneskop Farmers Association are Trustees of the Matiwaneskop Syndicate. There is also a Commonage, which is land not allocated to a specific person. It is mainly used for grazing.</li> <li>Tribal Authority Land: INkosi Shabalala is responsible for this land.</li> </ol>	
Mthembu Traditional Authority	Eskom needs to understand that there are areas with Land Claims in the Weenen District.  Eskom should compensate people who will be affected by the proposed project.	Noted.  Compensation is paid to directly affected land and property owners. See comments above.
Abantungwa-kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authorities	Should there be a need for resettlement, compensation rates should be the same irrespective of the material the houses are made of.	Noted.
Amanteshe Traditional Authority	Detailed explanation of how compensation for various land uses is done should be provided if Amanteshe Traditional Authority is affected.	Noted.
	Eskom should take cognisance of the fact that the Ingonyama Trust is the custodian of Traditional Authority Land. Therefore Ingonyama Trust should be consulted in this regard.	Noted.
7. Project alternatives a	and technical queries	
Mr Graham BD McIntosh	Is there another Transmission Power Line route other than the Majuba-Venus one? My farm surrounds the Venus substation.	There are two main options – Majuba-Venus I and II – both from Venus substation. Other options could include one of the smaller lines, but these have not been considered in any detail.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Jeff Scrooby Petronet	Petronet, being a division of Transnet Limited, has no objection in principle to the proposed EIAs for the construction and upgrade of access roads and Transmission Power Lines crossing the 323,8 and 406,4 mm diameter pipelines within Transnet's 6,1 and 6 m wide pipeline servitudes as indicated on your drawing.	
	This authority to proceed shall only be valid for six months from the date of this letter. If it is envisaged that the work will commence at a later stage an extension of time must be requested timeously.	
	CONDITIONS Prior to commencement of work it is required that a representative of Petronet be present to indicate the position of the pipelines and to undertake any work on Transnet's pipelines that may be necessary. In this connection the Servitude Supervisor, Mr Klippies Kritzinger, can be contacted at 034 989 9512 at least 14 days before the date on which you wish to commence the work in the vicinity of the pipelines.	
	Arrangements will also be made to visit the site periodically whilst the work is in progress.	
	Should the work be undertaken without Petronet's representative being contacted as mentioned above, Petronet reserves the right to request that you expose the pipeline at your cost in order that an examination can be made for possible damage.	
	The attached standard conditions and requirements for overhead cables must be complied with.	
	You are requested to forward detailed drawings of the proposal on finalisation of design. Frere, Ladysmith, Elandslaagte and Besters cadastrals with pipeline routes are attached for your information and reference.	
	On completion of the work you are required to return a copy of this letter to our office, duly endorsed and designed by your site representative as well as Petronet's site representative that the work was satisfactorily completed and conditions adhered to.	
Mr Alf Lees Ladysmith and District Farmers Association	I am concerned that the Majuba-Venus #2 Power Line is the only option being considered for the connection to the National Grid. Why is the Majuba-Venus #1 line not under consideration as well? I already have three Power Lines through my farm, and I do not want another one, as would be the case with this proposed route.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Roy Ryan KZN Dept of Transport	District Road 48 and 474: Proposed Braamhoek 400 kV Transmission Power Lines and sub-station, construction and upgrade of access roads for the Eskom Braamhoek PSS: Situated in the Administrative District and Province of KZN.	Noted. Information forwarded to Eskom who will respond once environmental authorisation is awarded.
	In terms of the KZN Provincial Roads Act. No 4 of 201 this Department has no objections to the proposed scheme subject to the following conditions.	
	All negotiations regarding the upgrading of provincial roads, access on to provincial roads, the positioning of Power Lines adjacent to and road crossing encroachments must be determined in consultation with and to satisfaction of this Department's Regional Director, Ladysmith (Tel. 036 635 5495).	
	Copies of your correspondence have been sent to the Regional Director for his attention and noting.	
Besters Farmers Association	The Besters Farmers Association requested that Eskom rules out the middle option, as it will affect the District of Besters Farmers more negatively as compared to increasing the servitude of Majuba-Venus #2 by 20m. The main reason behind their request is that farmers felt that it is easier for Eskom to increase the servitude.	
	What is the size of land required for a substation?	The actual footprint of the substation is 320m x 160m but the land required for the substation is 400m x 400m.
	What is the status of cross-rope suspension towers?	A cross-rope suspension tower is the preferred tower type for cost and environmental reasons. It is less visually intrusive compared to other towers but the support strings on either side of the tower sometimes need to be placed outside the 55m servitude.
	What is the status of existing servitudes?	The existing servitudes on the Majuba-Venus I and II lines will need to be widened by another 20m. This means that farmers will be asked to sign acceptance for an additional 20m. Eskom will negotiate with individual landowners.
	Farmers requested clarity on the number of lines that Eskom will have in the Besters Farmers District.	It was clarified that eventually there will be three lines $x$ 55m = 165m servitude for the Turn-ins if the new Braamhoek-Venus line follows the Majuba-Venus #2 line to the west.
	When is the construction of the Transmission Power Lines and Substation Integration anticipated to start?	The construction of the Pumped Storage Scheme is expected to start in 2006/2007. The Sub-station and Transmission Power Line will probably follow soon afterwards.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Ladysmith and District Farmers Association	Clarity was requested on the issue of a vacant servitude whether it indicates that landowners have agreed on a second Power Line within their properties.	Landowners signed for two servitudes on the Majuba-Venus #2. The agreement was for the construction of one 400kV Transmission Power Line and a construction of a second line at a later stage.
	Where is the vacant servitude in relation to the existing 400kV Transmission Power Line?	The vacant servitude is on the western side of the existing Majuba-Venus II Power Line.
	Mr Alan Green indicated that Eskom did not explain to him that he would have another Power Line on his property on signing the Majuba-Venus #2 Transmission Power Line servitude agreement.	
	The Ladysmith and District Farmers Association would like to understand what information is going to guide the assessment. It is not fair for Eskom to say that because farmers have existing Power Lines on their properties, it is easier to have another one. Eskom's intention is to minimise costs at the expense of farmers.	
	Farmers highlighted that they are aware of the fact that Eskom wants to make their properties corridors for Power Lines as it is convenient for Eskom to do routine maintenance, for example, by flying over one corridor, use same access gates, etc.	
	Farmers are concerned that their properties are basically a corridor for Eskom's Power Lines. In this regard, the relevance of undertaking environmental investigations on the Braamhoek-Venus route is being questioned since it is Eskom's preferred route. In addition, farmers expressed their view that once the Government has made a decision, Eskom will build the Power Line anyway.	the validity of an appeal.
	How can the Project Team state that the Braamhoek-Venus route is less environmentally sensitive than the Braamhoek-Pegasus route?	Mr Stuart Dunsmore clarified that the latter statement indicates that there is more opportunity to minimise the environmental impacts in the Braamhoek-Venus route when compared to the Braamhoek-Pegasus route.
Colenso Farmers Association	Why is Eskom following Majuba-Venus #1 and #2?	Both Majuba-Venus #1 and #2 have vacant servitudes. However they do not have 55m servitude for a 400kV Transmission Power Line. Eskom requires approximately 20m to be added to make up the required servitude width i.e. 55m.
	How long will the new section of the line be?	The Majuba-Venus #2 seems to have more potential and will only require 10km of new ground.
Abantungwa-kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authorities	When will construction of the Transmission Power Line commence?	The construction of the Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme is expected to start in 2006/2007. The Sub-station and Transmission Power Line will probably follow soon afterwards.
	Which energy source will Eskom use for generating electricity?	The Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme will use water as the energy source. The Pumped Storage Scheme will pump water from a lower to an upper reservoir and then release this water during peak load hours to generate electricity.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Amantesha Traditional Authority	When is Eskom expecting the construction of the Transmission Power Line to start?	The construction of the Pumped Storage Scheme is expected to start in 2006/2007. The Sub-station and Transmission Power Line will probably follow soon afterwards.
	What do Transmission Power Lines do?	Transmission Power Lines transport bulk power supply from Generation Stations and large power users via the National Network.
	There are no direct benefits to the Amanteshe Traditional Authority, Eskom only wants to have the route through the Tribal land.	Transmission lines therefore offer no direct benefit to landowners.
Besters Farmers Association	In Europe and Australia they lay cables underground.	In Europe/Australia they lay cables up to 66kV underground, though the larger the cable usually the shorter the distance (an underground 22kV line is approx. 4.5 times the cost of an overhead equivalent). Underground Transmission lines (i.e. above 132kV) are rare, and usually only for very short distances. There are various reasons for Transmission lines not to go underground. These include:  To place a 400kV Transmission Power Line underground would typically involve digging a trench equivalent to a three-lane road and 2m metres in depth to accommodate up to 12 separate cables.  Cost implication — it costs approximately R1,5 million per kilometre to construct an overhead 400kV Transmission line, the underground costs are more than 20 times more i.e. more than R20 million per kilometre.  The impact on vegetation when clearing the servitude.  Development and landuse in the cable servitude is severely restricted because of the need to protect the cables from damage and for permanent access to be available to carry out repairs when necessary.  Excavation of land for cable installation is much more disruptive to landowners and the land than overhead lines.  To avoid root damage to cables, no trees or hedges are allowed to grow over or near cables and no excavations can be made below 0.5m in the vicinity of the cable.  Conductors generate a lot of heat. If conductors are underground they need to be surrounded by oil for cooling. Overhead lines are directly cooled by the surrounding air.
B. CONSTRUCTION A	AND UPGRADE OF ACCESS ROADS	
8. Tourism-related issu		·
Adv George Galloway Skeurklip Conservancy and Farm Owner	Surfaced roads would improve tourism potential. Will a visual impact assessment be conducted for the project?	along with various other specialist studies. Alan Cave of Cave Klapwijk and Associates has been appointed to do this study.
Unidentified stakeholder	What type of vehicles will use the roads after construction? What about tourism potential? Why have you not considered other alternatives?	Primarily light vehicles for Eskom staff with occasional trucks. Local residents will be able to use the roads. Various alternatives are being considered in the EIA, and input from I&APs will also be taken into account in choosing the preferred alternative.
9. Agriculture and farm	ning operations	

NAME &	HOEK PUMPED STORAGE SCHEME	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	NEOPONOE
Adv George Galloway Skeurklip Conservancy and Farm Owner	What about evaluations and rates payable on land that will be utilised by Eskom for the project?	There is an option that exists where landowners can register land with minimal use as "conservation land". The farmer can still use the land, however, he/she is exempt from taxes, in terms of the Protected Areas Act (Act N <sup>0</sup> 57 of 2003).
	Surfaced roads would also improve farming activities.	Noted.
Mr Bruce Nel Rosedale Farm	I am a landowner on the Van Reenen - Oaklands Road, (Rosedale Farm), with the following concern:  Access	No upgrading of Oaklands Road is proposed for the Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme.
10. Ecological impacts	and biodiversity conservation	
Ms Dinesree Thambu Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife	In the interim, and to assist EKZNW in the investigation of biodiversity issues, we request clarity with regard to the proposed alternative access routes, as the illustrations in the BID appear contradictory (for example, the line segment JE in figure 4a is identified as a 'proposed gravel road', but in figures 4b, c and d this same route is identified as an 'existing gravel road'). Please direct any queries in this regard to the Coordinator IEM (033 845 1346).	alternatives will also be included in the Draft Scoping Report on which EKZNW will have the opportunity to comment.  Africon submitted a copy of the Draft Extended Scoping Report to Mr W Bekker as well as Ms Thambu of Ezemvelo in December 2005 and January 2006 respectively
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	What are impacts on the virgin land within the study area? This must be addressed in the EIA in association with Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife.	Potential impacts on virgin land include disturbance of fauna and flora, pollution of soil and water and aesthetic impacts such as noise, dust and visual impacts. These impacts will, however, be mitigated through implementing an Environmental Management Plan (EMP), which will specify practical and effective measures to minimise negative impacts and enhance positive impacts. The EMP will also specify monitoring requirements and regular auditing to ensure that the EMP requirements are being met. These potential impacts will be further investigated during the next phase of the EIA with various specialist studies. Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife will have the opportunity to comment on both the Draft Scoping Report and the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) and can therefore contribute meaningfully to the EIA and ensure that your issues and concerns are addressed.  An Ezemvelo KZN Wildlife representative was present at the Key Stakeholder Workshop and formal submission has been promised by EKZNW (see rows above).
Mr MJ Jansen Wapad Trust	Re: Building of road on Wapad No. 1635  With reference to our conversation with Eskom on 1/12/04 at Hamilberg School, we (Wapad Trust) would like to suggest the following:  Alternative  2: De Beers Escarpment route. This is a relatively short route and will not cause a lot of disturbances to its natural surrounding.	Upgrading of De Beers Pass is proposed in Alternatives 3 and 4 – your preference is noted.
Mr Bruce Nel Rosedale Farm	I am a landowner on the Van Reenen - Oaklands Road, (Rosedale Farm), with the following concern:  Wetland conservancy.	
Mr Danie Coetzee	If alternative 4 i.e. Kiesbeen (Figure 4d) is implemented no damage will be done to plant and bird life because it is already an existing road. Alternative 4a is also midway between Johannesburg and Durban.	Your comments are duly noted.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Angus Burns Ekangala Grassland Trust	An extensive faunal survey has been conducted which could be of great benefit for both components of study. This information is available freely to both project teams. Please contact me for further information.	The Draft Scoping Report contains information on fauna obtained from the original EIA conducted for the actual Braamhoek PSS. However, we welcome any additional information available. A specialist ecological assessment (including faunal study) will be undertaken during the impact assessment phase of the EIA.
		Dr Niels Jacobsen undertook an ecological survey in September/October 2005
Mr Hendrik van der Merwe.	The flora and fauna must be respected during construction activities. We would like to work with the specialists to help save and relocate whatever we can. An action plan must be compiled to this effect.	Comments noted. Eskom has been notified in this regard.
Mr P Lombaard	What is the ecological cost of the impact of the construction of the roads? This should be considered and not only the length and cost in Rands and Cents.	Resource economics is a tricky science and it is difficult to assign a Rand value to potential environmental impacts. However, all aspects need to be considered and this will be taken into consideration during the EIA and the various specialist studies that will be conducted.
11. Cultural heritage re	source management	
Mr Gabriel Tlhapi South African Heritage Resources Agency	Please note that the South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA) may require a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) in terms of Section 38 of the National Heritage Resources Act, No. 25 of 19999 if it is not already required by another Act. If an evaluation of the impact of the development is required in terms of another act, such as the Environmental Conservation Act, 1989 an evaluation of the impact of the development on heritage resources must fulfil the requirements of the SAHRA in terms of Subsection (3) of Section 38 of the National Heritage Resources Act. In view of the above we require that a qualified archaeologist be appointed to identify and assess potential archaeological sites and material, as well as other heritage resources, such as graves and buildings older than 60 years that may be affected by the proposed development. This report must contain as a minimum the information specified in Section 38 (3) of the National Heritage Resources Act.	assessment will be provided in the Environmental Impact Report on which Interested and Affected Parties will have the opportunity to comment.  Archaeology Africa, in conjunction with Matakoma Heritage Consultants (a Amafa accredited consultant) undertook a Heritage Impact Assessment in September to November 2005
Ms Karen van Ryneveld Amafa aKwaZulu-Natali	No complete Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) has been done in the particular area. Amafa aKwaZulu-Natali would require a HIA to be done by an Amafa accredited CRM specialist in terms of Section 27 (1) (a) and 27 (1) (c) (v) of the KwaZulu-Natal Heritage Act, No 10 of 1997.  Note that the HIA may be done after finalization of the exact location of the sub-division, line and access road.  NB: This submission contained a list of Amafa accredited CRM specialists.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr McEdward Murimbika Institute for Cultural Resource Management	The Institute for Cultural Resource Management (ICRM) is an accredited institution responsible for Heritage Impact Assessment, Mitigation and Monitoring; Heritage Resources Management Planning and Cultural Resources Management Policing.  As such, the ICRM is interested in providing the HIA services as part of the EIA process recently announced. Furthermore, we would like to view the results of such a study in order for us to capture them in our database and to mark off areas that are archaeologically surveyed for subsequent studies or impact considerations.  Please note that our interests are service provision and research. The Heritage Authorities, the Amafa KwaZulu-Natali and the Heritage Council and the SAHRA are the compliance agencies in terms of the KwaZulu-Natal Heritage Act, (Act No. 10 of 1997) and National Heritage Resources Act, (Act no 25 of 1999).  The cultural heritage impact assessment should make provision for both the physical cultural properties, such as archaeological sites, as well as the intangible heritage (e.g. socio – cultural practices that may be impacted upon by the shift in the <i>status quo</i> ).  As part of the EIA, the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment should be structured in such a way that it captures impacts on physical cultural sites as well as assessing the impacts on potential intangible heritage resources such as community practices or	study will be provided in the EIR. It is possible to provide the full report for capturing onto your database. Please contact Ms. Deidre Herbst of Eskom Generation in this regard.  Archaeology Africa, in conjunction with Matakoma Heritage Consultants (a Amafa accredited consultant) undertook a Heritage Impact Assessment in September to November 2005. The results of this will be forwarded to the ICRM.
Mr M Jansen	socio-cultural values attached to both the bio-physical and human environments that may be affected (negatively or positively) by the proposed developments.  The 'Klipgat' cave that will be flooded is an historic site that was used by my grandfather Maqotian de Villiers to protect his livestock against the Basoetoe poachers.	This issue was dealt with under the original EIA conducted for the Braamhoek PSS. The Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism issued a Record of
	He lived there at stages and one of his children was born there. I strongly object!	Decision authorising the construction of the Braamhoek PSS in 2002. This current EIA deals only with the upgrading and construction of access and site roads and therefore does not deal with the flooding of caves by the reservoirs.
Unidentified stakeholder	What will you do if the road traverses a grave?	The EIA team has appointed specialists to conduct studies so as to try and avoid such instances. Also, we will rely on information provided by I&APS to indicate where existing graves are, so we can inform the specialists. Graves and other such items of cultural and heritage importance will be avoided as far as possible. Where this is not possible, Eskom will comply with the requirements of the National Heritage Resources Act and apply for the required permit to move such items.
12. Social and socio-ec	onomic issues	
Mr Theunis de Jager Theunis de Jager Trust	Obtain landowners permission to access their property.	Eskom will obtain the relevant owner's permission to access their properties.
Sir Bruce Hervey Oaklands Country Manor	Poor condition of access roads on routes other than those identified in EIA (e.g. S793 Van Reenen – De Beers Pass).  Lack of hotel accommodation/restaurants in local Harrismith/Van Reenen area. Impact of new employment opportunities on existing businesses. Impact of heavy traffic on rural community. Social impact of migrant workers on rural communities (STD, crime etc).	Only the roads included in the preferred option identified through consultation with I&APs and using environmental and technical criteria, will be upgraded. Please consult your local municipality regarding the poor condition of other roads. This EIA does not address the lack of hotels and restaurants in the area. A basic socio-economic study will be conducted during the next phase of the EIA and will address positive and negative impacts on local communities.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Jethro Mofokeng	The following issues needs to be considered:  Existing services within the project area.  Accommodation facilities of employees.  Specialist studies to investigate identified issues.  Consider youth for future planning.	The presence of existing services will be taken into account during the road design and construction.  Construction workers will be housed in temporary Contractor's campsites, with adequate facilities. During the operational phase, employees will be housed and the relevant communities will be consulted.
Adv George Galloway Skeurklip Conservancy and Farm Owner	Will the roads be for public use?	The access roads will be built and upgraded by Eskom. The roads will then be handed over to the Regional Roads Department for maintenance and public use.
Mr Francois Poggenpoel	Who will control the access routes and ensure that Eskom and Contractor's vehicles are using the correct route?	There will be contract documents with specifications. Vehicles transporting goods will be obliged to follow certain routes.
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	Eskom is a 'giant' company and operates in areas where communities are poor. Eskom has a corporate social investment programme. How do you ensure that local people benefit from these developments?	
Mr Moloi Hamilberg School Principal	Thank you to Eskom and the team for the presentations today. The proposed additional infrastructure will assist with poverty relief.	Eskom notes your comment. Thank you for your positive response.
Unidentified stakeholder Hamilberg Public Open Day	There is a potential for loss of residence for farm labourers, should they decide to apply for jobs with Eskom. What will Eskom do to prevent this situation?	Local people must sort out their own accommodation needs. Eskom acknowledges that these are potential issues and will need to be considered. Eskom will consult the Department of Labour and provide an official response.
Unidentified stakeholder	This project will have negative impacts on our environment during construction, e.g. pollution, construction camps, litter, informal settlements, increase in crime, etc.	The environmental team deals with these issues during the EIA process. Environmental Management Plans (a requirement of the Record of Decision) will be compiled and an Environmental Control Officer will ensure that the environment is protected as far as possible. Potential sites for construction camps have been identified, which will be located in areas that are not so sensitive.  There are many negative social issues related to Contractor's construction campsites. Eskom attempts to regulate contractors to reduce negative social issues. The landowners must assist Eskom in preventing informal settlements on their land.  There are regulations in the EMP to which the contractor will need to adhere.
Mr Theunis de Jager Theunis de Jager Trust	Roads must be fenced off. Obtain landowners permission to access their property.	Roads will be fenced in 30 m nominal road reserve. Eskom will obtain the relevant landowner's permission to access their properties.
Sir Bruce Hervey Oaklands Country Manor	Poor condition of access roads on routes other than those identified in EIA (e.g. S793 Van Reenen – De Beers Pass)	Only the roads included in the preferred option identified through consultation with I&APs and using environmental and technical criteria, will be upgraded. Please consult your local municipality regarding the poor condition of other
	Lack of hotel accommodation/restaurants in local Harrismith/Van Reenen area. Impact of heavy traffic on rural community.  Social impact of migrant workers on rural communities (STD, crime etc).	roads. This EIA does not address the lack of hotels and restaurants in the area. A basic socio-economic study will be conducted during the next phase of the EIA and will address positive and negative impacts on local communities.
Mr ZS Dlamini	It would be appreciated if the roads are upgraded because it will benefit the community in many ways.	Eskom notes your comment, but it should be noted that only the roads included in the preferred option will be upgraded.

FINAL SCOPING REPORT COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	Where possible, existing facilities should be used both for construction of the Transmission Power Line as well as Access Roads to the lower and upper reservoirs. Such facilities could be upgraded, possibly for water supply, etc.	Existing facilities and services will be used where appropriate.
	The Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality is currently busy with the development of access roads, which is aimed at improving the quality of life of people in the area. In the Driefontein area, there are also economic development projects both at a local and regional level. Therefore, development needs to be co-ordinated with the Local Municipality so that development plans are integrated where possible.	
Mr BS Cibane Vukuzakhe Association	I appreciate the opportunity and this is a step forward for Eskom. It is important for Eskom to look into developing the small emerging contractors when building the access roads, especially black companies. This can be done by allowing these companies to enter the data base and allocate jobs. The process should be well monitored, supported and well supervised to avoid favoritism to family members and friends of Eskom employees. If there are forms to enter for the database, please provide them. Keep up the good work and I look forward to your response.	awarded to BEE Contractors. Eskom supports small, medium and micro enterprises and large black businesses for the procurement of goods and services. When construction for these projects begins Eskom will implement a
13. Land tenure and co	mpensation	
Nkosi NB Shabalala Shabalala TA & Emnambithi Regional Authority	Taking into consideration the ownership of land will remain with the original owner is appreciated.	Your comment is noted. Eskom will register servitudes where necessary. The land will be valued and the amount will be negotiated with the landowner.
Unidentified Stakeholder	Will there be compensation for land?	Yes. The land will be valued and the amount will be negotiated with the landowner.
Unidentified stakeholder Hamilberg School	Eskom does not own all this land. How do you propose to build on the land? Can we get more information about the servitudes and compensation process?	Eskom will register servitudes.
14. Job creation and ed	conomic opportunities	
Unidentified stakeholder Hlomisa Public Open Day	Will Eskom only construct roads for the reservoirs? What about roads in this area? How will this project provide jobs?	The project will provide jobs and 80% of labourers will be sourced locally.
Mr Moloi Hamilberg School Principal	Many unemployed people have no skills. Can Eskom provide opportunities with training and teaching, so that when construction commences, they are in a position to apply for jobs?	skills development.
Mr Phillip Dlamini Local resident	Many people are unemployed and when contractors come from other areas, locals are not provided with opportunities.	There will be various contracts and various contractors. The contractor will be contracted (in documents) to recruit local people for local benefits.
Mr Jan du Plessis Farmer	The majority of the community works for the farmers. Eskom will, thus, be employing our labourers.	Eskom cannot prevent community members from seeking alternative employment. Legally, Eskom cannot turn people away. We do acknowledge that it is an issue for further attention.
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	What SMME opportunities exist, specifically manual labour contracts?	It is government policy to use manual labour and SMMEs. It is estimated that approximately 5 000 man months of work will be created during construction, which means that labour will be employed for 18 months.
Unidentified stakeholder	When construction commences, what chance do the local community have in seeking employment? Most contractors bring their own labourers into the area.	There will be various contracts and various contractors. Approximately 20% of people will comprise core staff or highly skilled people. Approximately 80% will comprise labour that will be recruited from the local community. The contractor will be contracted (in documents) to recruit local people for local benefits.

NAME &	MHOEK PUMPED STORAGE SCHEME  ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION	100000	
Cllr Sipho Zwane Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Council	Will you involve emerging contractors in the project?	Stewart Scott is known to work with local contractors and will appoint various contractors for specific tasks (unbundling of contracts). Estimates have been calculated that there will be 20 months of construction with approximately 3 000 labourers. This equates to 60 000 man months. The main opportunities for emerging contractors, thus, fall within the construction phase.
'Nkosi NB Shabalala Shabalala Traditional Authority & Emnambithi Regional Authority	Employment of local people will be highly appreciated.	Eskom notes the potential positive socio-economic impacts this project could have on local communities and unskilled labour will be sourced from local communities where possible during the construction of the roads. It should, however, be stressed that these jobs would only be temporary.
Mr BS Cibane Vukuzakhe Association	I appreciate the opportunity and this is a step forward for Eskom. As I pointed out during the briefing, it is important for Eskom to look into developing the small emerging contractors when building access roads especially black companies. This can be done by allowing these companies to be entered on the database and be allocated jobs. The process should be well monitored supported and well supervised to avoid favouritism to family members and friends of Eskom employees.  If there are forms to complete in order to be entered onto the database please provide them. Keep the good work going and I am looking forward to your response.	under their small contractor scheme called Vukuzakhe. This however needs to be discussed with Eskom. Stewart Scott International has much experience with the scheme in KwaZulu-Natal.
Mr Mike Lindsay	Is the unbundling of contracts policy within Stewart Scott and Eskom? This is a good idea as long as the contracts are strictly controlled.	There will be a main contractor appointed with responsibility/legal obligation to a contract document. The idea is still under investigation and methods of contract appointment are still being discussed with the various role-players. Furthermore, there are various elements of local resources and skills within the local area which can be utilised for the project. Eskom encourages contracts with the bigger companies, but also encourages joint ventures with the smaller companies. Eskom's commercial division will be available in the near future (date to be confirmed) where contractors can learn how to register on the tender list and the process of pairing. Eskom will have an open day for this purpose at some stage during the EIA. Eskom will provide physical assistance with registration.
Mr Henk Badenhorst	Development in the Free State is a high priority and job creation is essential. The N3 carries a high volume of traffic and we need the greater area to be opened up for ecotourism potential. A scenario must be developed whereby various aspects benefit from such a project. Eskom should consider the 'bigger picture'. Also, local labour must be utilised.	Eskom is a parastatal with certain policies in place for the procurement of local labour and the training thereof. For the construction and upgrade of the roads, the construction period will be 20 months. Approximately 3 000 people will be employed. This equates to 60 000 man months of employment. A limited number of skilled labour (e.g. machine/vehicle operators) would be required for road construction.
Mr Phillip Dlamini Local resident	Many people are unemployed and when contractors come from other areas, locals are not provided with opportunities.	There will be various contracts and various contractors. The contractor will be contracted (in documents) to recruit local people for local benefits.
Mr Dirk Vermeulen Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	Who will be responsible for road maintenance? It is imperative that our community become embedded into the process. Free State labour cannot be imported to work in these areas. It is important that these issues are discussed with the City Engineer (Mr A Sompersadh).	The issue of maintenance is currently being discussed with the various roads departments, SANRAL and the N3TC. Eskom will endeavour to utilise local labour wherever possible and will liaise with the City Engineer.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Enoch Mazibuko Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	In terms of job creation, does Eskom only focus on the study area, or are other areas considered too? What will local benefits include?	process. For example, bush clearing may be an opportunity for local contractors. The service provided by contractors is the most important criteria. During construction, there will be spin-off benefits for the local community, including retail, catering, equipment and supplies.
Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	Mr Vermeulen questioned as to how would 80% of local labour be sourced. He highlighted that as the Municipality is involved in development they need to ensure that the local labour aspect is translated into practicality.  There should be an agreement on how "decision makers" are going to give effect to the implementation of employment practices. This has to be addressed adequately and discussions with the Access Roads Team are critical.  It is important for the Municipality to look at joint ventures for job creation and social economic development.	KwaZulu-Natal Department of Transport requested that roads be constructed under their small contractor scheme called Vukuzakhe. This however needs to be discussed with Eskom. Stewart Scott International has much experience with
	The South African National Roads Agency is doing intensive work in the Van Reenen area. Therefore, there is a potential for conflict if Eskom is not sensitive to local issues. There are a number of concerns from Besters and van Reenen residents.	
15. Project alternatives		
Mr Danie Coetzee	If alternative 4 - Kiesbeen (Figure 4d) is implemented no damage will be done to plant and Birdlife because it is already an existing road. Alternative 4a is also midway between Johannesburg and Durban.	Your preference for Alternative 4 is noted.
Mr M Jansen	Tar road over De Beers Pass via Kiesbeen. No new roads.	Your preference for Alternative 4 is noted.
Mr Roy Ryan KZN Dept of Transport	District Road 48 and 474: Proposed Braamhoek 400 kV Transmission Power Lines and sub-station, construction and upgrade of access roads for the Eskom Braamhoek PSS: Situated in the Administrative District and Province of KZN.  In terms of the KZN Provincial Roads Act. No 4 of 201 this Department has no objections to the proposed scheme subject to the following conditions.	Eskom will liase with the relevant departments. Thank you for your comment.
	All negotiations regarding the upgrading of provincial roads, access onto provincial roads, the positioning of Power Lines adjacent to and road crossing encroachments must be determined in consultation with and to the satisfaction of this Department's Regional Director, Ladysmith (Tel. 036 635 5495).	
	Copies of your correspondence have been sent to the Regional Director for his attention and noting.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Tony Christopher Cotswold Farm Trust	1. You have indicated that construction of such a pass up the escarpment will take into account the aesthetics, and the road would in any event proceed no further than the upper reservoir. This would in effect mean that the Braamhoek Pass Road would be used by Eskom vehicles and local farmers only. Impact to the north side of the farm Cotswold will therefore be minimized.	
	2. The gradients on the Braamhoek Pass are likely to be much more favourable than those in De Beers Pass, the gradients of which are presently dangerous and unlikely to be resolved without considerable expense. The De Beers Pass furthermore will involve the construction of considerably more roadway than the Braamhoek Pass alternative, and involve the State in much greater expense.	
	3. Braamhoek Pass also has the advantage as far as I am concerned that it would not involve the construction of any road along the KwaZulu-Natal/Free State boarder from De Beers Pass to the upper reservoir. Such a road would have several negative impacts as far as the farm Cotswold is concerned, not least of which are security issues, noise, dust, and the inevitable erosion of soil down the escarpment into dams which exist on Cotswold from roads and road verges.	
	4. The construction of the Braamhoek Pass is likely to be much cheaper to run than any other alternative because of light traffic flows. It will need less maintenance in the long term.	
Mr Thamsanqa E Mazibuko Emnambithi Local Municipality	The inclusion of D797 to be upgraded from gravel road to tarred road since this road is serving the densely populated settlements Kleinfontein, Rantjiesvlatte, Roodepoort and Watershed, which are the nearest settlements which are very underdeveloped. The improvement of this road will benefit these areas in numerous ways and the electrification of these areas is scheduled for 2007/8.	form part of roads required for the Braamhoek Scheme and you should contact your local Municipality in this regard.
	We are in favour of Fig 4a. It is cost effective and the environmental disturbance will be minimal since existing roads will be upgraded.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr MJ Jansen Wapad Trust	Re: Building of road on Wapad No. 1635  With reference to our conversation with Eskom on 1/12/04 at Hamilberg School, we (Wapad Trust) would like to suggest the following:  Alternative 2:	
	De Beers Escarpment route. This is a relatively short route and will not cause a lot of disturbances to its natural surrounding. This route will offer the ideal outcome, because pensioners have to travel to van Reenen every month to draw money. This route is also used to get to Ladysmith. Minimum building of bridges and no expensive construction needs to be done. Cell phone reception on the Escarpment is first-rate. The route is already used for Power Lines and is also used by the farmers of the surrounding area.	Your preference for Alternative 2 (De Beers-Escarpment) is noted.
	There is one change suggested for the route on the farm Wapad No 1635. The current entrance/route is next to the Free State-Natal border, but on the map the route shifts approx 300 m into the Free State. We as landowners (Wapad Trust) request that the route is constructed directly next to the Free State-Natal border, as there is already two roads on the farm, and another one will diminish the farm size even more, as well as dividing it into more unusable sections without water.	Route has been relocated to the boundary except where gradients are steep and it is necessary to pass around a pronounced ridge.
	There is an ironstone edge next to the Free State-Natal border that can be used for gravel for construction of a tar road, and the farm will not be diminished or left divided into unused sections.	
	The Wapad Trust is prepared to relinquish the servitude if the route is planned this way. Another advantage of the route next to the Free State-Natal border, is that the road does not traverse between vulnerable marsh. We have just rehabilitated the marsh with Waterworks and would not want to see that our hard work was in vain.	
	We also use the Free State-Natal border as a veld fire buffer. Every year the farmers pre-burn a strip next to the Escarpment route. The tar road will help as a buffer against fires.	
Mr Earl (CE)Leathern Vizitrade Seven Pty Ltd	Farm Bloemhof. His family owns 'Escarpment link' and it is not a Provincial Road. His family is keen to negotiate a servitude with Eskom if this Alternative is a favoured option.	Your co-operation is appreciated.
Mr MJ Jansen Wapad Trust	I suggest that the road must be from the lower dam via the De Beers Pass and over Kiesbeen to Skeurklip.	Your preference for Alternative 3 (De Beers - Skeurklip) is noted.
	Reasons: i) It is an existing road, ii) It is cost effective to upgrade, iii) it is not a new road that needs to be built across veld, iv) it has a greater advantage to the community, in regards to access to towns and hospitals, and v) can later be used to promote tourism.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Danie Coetzee	Using the alternative for Kiesbeen will have a huge advantage because it is an existing road and no or very little plant and birdlife will be disturbed or damaged. It will also in a very big way simplify the Scoping process.  The gradient on all the other roads (4a, 4b, 4c) is much greater than 4a and all the	Your preference for Alternative 3 (De Beers – Skeurklip) is noted.
Mr Bradley Gibbons Wildlife and Environment Society of SA	above 3 will limit the access of big vehicles.  The N3 is proposed to be upgraded from Warden to the De Beers Pass. How will this affect the Braamhoek developments? Would the developments affect the positioning of the access roads?	Current thinking is that the upgrade will only be done in about 2019. However, we have taken the N3 upgrade into consideration in our planning and design, but it does not affect the project. A road system develops and interchanges will have to be constructed at a later date to accommodate the new road. The Braamhoek project will also be taken into account during the N3 upgrade planning and design.  Construction of the access roads will commence in 2007. The Braamhoek scheme will be finalised in 2011/2012. We, thus, have to plan accordingly, without the upgraded N3. When the N3 is built, the possibility of interchanges will be considered.  Mr Andrew Dhebideen representing N3TC at the Key Stakeholder Workshop, stated that the construction of the N3 will only commence in 10 years time. We would need to talk to Eskom about the possibility of constructing interchanges.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr CJ Landman South African National Roads Agency Ltd	National Concession Route 3 Sections 6 & 7.  As you have been advised through the N3 Toll Concession Company, the SA National Roads Agency (SANRAL) has a route known as the De Beers Pass proclaimed which will ultimately traverse portions of the properties mentioned in your EIA as being the location of parts of the above mentioned scheme.  De Beers Pass is to be built by the N3 Toll Concessionaire.  There is a preliminary designed route within the proclaimed National Road Reserve that could be made available by the N3 Toll Concessionaire on request as this could influence Eskom's decision on which proposal to opt for.  SANRAL/N3 Toll Concessionaire 's concerns in terms of the proposal are the following:  • There could be changes to the alignment of the current design route of De Beer's Pass.  • As the route is aimed at being a limited access route, access will only be allowed at future interchanges, the positions of which have not been finalized.  • Should the access routes to the pump storage scheme or Transmission Power Lines not be positioned to coincide with where interchanges are ultimately built, Eskom would have to relocate them at their own cost.  In terms of the SA National Roads Agency and National Roads Act, Act 7 of 1998 access off National Roads may only be taken once approved by SANRAL. In the case approval can only be given conditionally upon the above requirement.  • Formal application for the positioning of the access roads over the proposed De Beers Pass route would therefore have to be made through this office and the Toll Concessionaire.  • Approval of access roads and Transmission Power Lines over the proclaimed National Road Reserve will be granted in the form of a wayleave with a removal clause and it will have to be relocated at the cost of Eskom provided the relocation is not required as a result of the realignment of the proclaimed National Road.  • Access off the current N3 to serve the Pump Storage Scheme would have to conform to the required standards and may have to be improved to a	Discussions have been held with N3TC. An application for a wayleave has been submitted.
Mr JH de Jager	If we favour a particular alternative, will that information be forwarded to Eskom for their consideration? Alternative 1 only favours Ladysmith and Alternatives 1 and 2 have a road on the escarpment, which is not favourable.	The discussion will be recorded, incorporated into the Issues Report and included in the Scoping Report for Eskom's information and for the consideration of the Authorities.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Adv George Galloway	How have the distances of the alternatives been calculated, specifically the 'new' roads?	The measurement is from the lower to the upper reservoir site. This includes existing gravel tracks that require surfacing. There will be a certain amount of major works done on existing roads and this has been included into the measurement, so it does not necessarily mean a completely 'new' road.
Mr T Coetzee	What is the general feeling regarding the alternatives?	A preferred alternative will emerge out of the scoping process
Mr Dave Short	It is important to consider the alternative that opens the area up for tourism, specifically eco-tourism. The area is currently badly serviced. Why not consider a joint venture with provincial and national government to assist with costs?	All relevant departments have been consulted and the project team has also discussed the proposed project with affected parties such as SANRAL and N3TC. Discussion with these parties will be ongoing throughout the project. The government departments also need to consider the fact that these roads will need to be maintained.
Mr JH de Jager	Apparently, the entire project is worth R 13 billion. The roads component is surely a small part of the project. The consideration of cost when deciding on which alternative should not be an influence compared to the total value of the project. Eskom owes us a decent road with benefits for the entire community.	It is correct to say that the total project is worth billions and roads are a small component thereof.
Unidentified stakeholder Swinburne Farmers Association	What about the S793? Was that not considered as an alternative?	No, it was not considered. The road has many sharp bends over the Wilge River and it would be difficult for trucks to travel safely on this road.
Mrs Jenni Cleverly.	Also, please note that Alternative 1 and 2 include the construction of new roads, which will result in much erosion.	Erosion will be limited by good design practise. However your concern is noted.
Mr Piet Roets	Only Alternatives 3 and 4 will benefit the Harrismith area.	Your preference for Alternatives 3 (De Beers – Skeurklip) and 4 (Kiesbeen) is noted.
Mr Gert Nel	When deciding on the preferred alternative, it should be noted that mist, snow, rain, hail, smoke, etc. are frequent in this area and especially up the escarpment. There will be a high accident level with the introduction of new roads.	Road signs will be provided to warn motorists of unsafe conditions. However your concern is noted.
Mr Henk Badenhorst.	The new N3 will be constructed when the demand arises. There should be a junction constructed with the Kiesbeen Road to open the area for eco-tourism potential. This would be the N3TC's responsibility.	As stated, this is a SA National Road Agency/SANRAL responsibility.
Mr Francois Poggenpoel on behalf of Farmers Associations within Harrismith District	<ul> <li>Mr Francois Poggenpoel highlighted why Alternatives 3 and 4 are favoured by the meeting attendees (specifically Alternative 3 with the upgrading of the S790):</li> <li>The potential for eco-tourism must be considered to open the area for development.</li> <li>The farming sector would benefit.</li> <li>Job opportunities in the Free State would be created.</li> <li>Wetland areas to be conserved would create some job opportunities.</li> <li>A direct link to the N3 would be created via the S790, which favours a broad spectrum of tourism.</li> <li>There would not be such severe effects on the environment with no road construction on the escarpment.</li> <li>Impacts would be minimised (fauna and flora, visual, erosion, wetlands, etc.).</li> <li>The area experiences heavy snow at times and this alternative is the safest alternative route during these weather conditions.</li> <li>The cost could potentially be shared with other institutions/organisations.</li> <li>Alternative 1 will only benefit Eskom.</li> </ul>	Your preference for Alternative 3 (De Beers – Skeurklip) or 4 (Kiesbeen) is noted.  This will be considered together with Eskom's requirement for access to scheme.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Andrew Moeti Department of Transport	Are all alternatives identified possible to construct?	Yes. The gradients, bends, turns, alignments, safety, etc. have all been taken into account when identifying alternatives. It must be noted that the roads will not be high speed roads, therefore, roads are being designed for 60-80 km per hour.
Unidentified stakeholder Hamilberg Primary School	What influence do we, as a community, have as to which option is chosen? Can we vote for the best option?	You need to tell us which option you like and why. You need to substantiate your issues too. It is not a vote as such, but your opinion will be evaluated and considered.
Mr Jan Du Plessis Farmer	Has Eskom conducted an impact study on the cost of road alternatives? The fourth alternative is the best, and the road along the escarpment is not a good alternative.	The costing forms part of the EIA and is currently being done.
Unidentified stakeholder	A road from Swinburne will benefit the entire community (i.e. Alternative 4).	Your preference of Alternative 4 is noted.
	What about a cable-way between dams?	This is not an option under consideration as it would be too expensive and not very practical with moving big machinery and trucks.
Unidentified stakeholder Hamilberg School	Alternative 3 and 4 are preferred as they involve the upgrading of the Skeurklip Road. The road from Besters and the Skeurklip Road are the two used by the majority of people in the area, and so should be upgraded.	Your preference for Alternative 3 (De Beers – Skeurklip) and 4 (Kiesbeen) are noted.
Unidentified stakeholder	What type of vehicles will use the roads after construction? What about tourism potential? Why have you not considered other alternatives?	During construction, heavy machinery will use the roads. During operation, 3 ton trucks will use the roads. There will be a minimum amount of traffic during operation. The construction period will be approximately 5.5 years. The roads will be for public use, thus boosting tourism potential in the area. Other alternatives were considered. However, these are the best four options for various reasons.
C J de Vos Pensioner	I suggest that 'Alternative 4 – Kiesbeen' is used, but with a request that the road from Swinburne to Kiesbeen is tarred, so that the Free State users could also benefit.	Your preference for Alternative 4 (Kiesbeen) is noted.
P L de Jager	Upgrading of Swinburne-Kiesbeen 5790, to be able to carry necessary cargo-traffic from Johannesburg N3.  To provide sensible access for eco-tourism and employees, etc. from Transvaal and Free State via 5790/N3 Swinburne to Braamhoek Project.  To provide the local communities currently using the road 5790 a durable access route through upgrading what otherwise would be diminished by heavy traffic.	Your preference is noted.
Emnambith/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	The Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality would like to see all the route alternatives and how they can be merged with their plans.	The Access Roads Project Team met with the Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality and Council on 18 February 2005 and route alternatives were discussed.
Mr Gert Loggenberg	I would like Alternative 4 (Figure 4d in the Background Information Document) Kiesbeen with a further upgrade of Route R T J I as 'Proposed Gravel Road'. It could be to the advantage of the community of Harrismith.	Your preference is noted.
16. Technical queries a	nd comments	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Unidentified stakeholder Hlomisa Public Open Day	Will Eskom only construct roads for the reservoirs? What about roads in this area?	The roads will be constructed specifically for access to the reservoirs. There are options that involve roads near this community. The EIA process includes the assessment of alternatives, taking all issues into consideration. Unfortunately, Eskom is not in the road building business; that is Provincial Government's responsibility. Eskom cannot please everyone, as many people have different requirements.
Mr Andrew Moeti Department of Transport	The P275 is currently not in good condition and the tarred section is approximately 5 km long. Will the road be widened and upgraded?	The road is in reasonably good condition and our recommendation would be to upgrade it. This is what is proposed in the alternatives identified.
Mrs Jenni Cleverly.	Is the cost of construction calculated per kilometre?	The estimation was done taking into account gravel layers, major bridges or culverts, cut and fill and compared using the same rates per kilometre.
Mrs Liona Kleynhans	During construction, Eskom will require access from KwaZulu-Natal and the Free State. After construction, Eskom will only require is a short maintenance route. There are already 13 passes between the two provinces. Roads along the escarpment are not favoured.	The need to provide a "short" access link between the reservoir sites may require that a new road up the escarpment be provided, however your concern is noted.
Mayor Gaba Makhathini Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	The construction and upgrade of roads project is only necessary because of the construction of a transmission Power Line and power station.	The primary reason for the construction and upgrade of roads, is the operation of the Eskom Pumped Storage Scheme.  The main purpose of the roads is to service the Pumped Storage Scheme and for access between the upper and lower reservoirs. One of the alternative roads identified will be constructed for Eskom and public use (funded by Eskom). There are some communities that will benefit from the upgraded/new roads.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Adv George Galloway Skeurklip Conservancy and Farm Owner	Will Alternative 1 be a public road after construction? Who would use that road beside myself? At the public meeting in November, it was stated that the initial upgrading would be gravel and that tarring would only occur in 2009. Is this true?	All provincial roads would be public roads after construction, except those servicing the upper and lower reservoir sites and other associated infrastructure (i.e. within Eskom owned properties). The construction of the roads should be completed by the beginning of 2008. Construction of other parts of the scheme may need to commence before the roads are completed. In other words some roads may not be surfaced before commencement of construction on other sections of the scheme.
	Will the access roads near the upper reservoir be surfaced? I was not informed that there would be a construction camp near the upper reservoir. Construction will require a large workforce with many people residing in the construction camp.	Yes, the access roads will be surfaced. There is a certain amount of geotechnical material that will need to be stored at the upper reservoir. The main construction camp will be located at the lower reservoir site. It currently takes approximately 3 hours to drive between the upper and lower reservoir sites. Eskom has also received a request to store material at the upper site and still needs to identify a site to accommodate a Geotechnical Team of 15-20 people.
	Will the roads be upgraded before 2007? What exactly does 'upgrading' mean?	It is planned that road construction will commence in mid-2006 and be completed by 2008. Some roads will be surfaced and others will have a gravel surface.
	What would the maintenance cost be over 10 years? Who will travel the road after construction, how many times a week, as there will not be staff at the upper site.	This has not yet been calculated. Only construction has been considered in the calculations. Also, time and travel costs should be taken into account. Please note that certain components of the Braamhoek PSS could possibly be constructed before all the roads are upgraded.
	Have the sites for gravel (borrow) pits been identified?	This has not yet been finalised. Aerial photography will enable engineers to identify suitable locations. This will form part of the EIA. Eskom is currently liaising with the Department of Minerals and Energy (DME) in this regard.
		Also, erosion has been identified as a major problem on site which will have to be taken into account during the Geotechnical Studies, construction and rehabilitation. A baseline study has been conducted on site. The erosion situation is much worse than anticipated, therefore Eskom has put extra measures in place to ensure that erosion can be mitigated.
		Borrow pit sites are currently being investigated and have not yet been finalised. There is a possible source at the lower reservoir site. However, it would not be suitable to transport material up the escarpment. A site near the upper reservoir is currently being sourced and the materials tested.
Mr Dave Short	During construction, the roads will be utilised to bring in equipment. What will happen after construction?	Eskom will require access during operation for the operation and maintenance activities for the PSS. Eskom, thus, has a vested interest in the project. The provincial roads department will maintain the provincial roads. However, Eskom also has an interest in the maintenance thereof.
Mr Lucky Thabethe Department of Transport	Who will be responsible for the maintenance of the roads?	The road maintenance will be the responsibility of the provincial Department of Transport. Discussions have been held with relevant departments.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Unidentified stakeholder Public Open Day	I am concerned that you will put in a toll road.	Definitely not. Eskom will build the road, but the road will belong to the Provincial Department of Transport.
A member of Swinburne Farmers Association	What about the issue of long-term maintenance? Also, the proposed N3 Toll Road crosses your roads in two places.	The EIA Team has been in consultation with the N3TC. The proposed N3 will only be constructed post-2010 as it is entirely dependent on traffic volumes and demand. There is no conflict with the N3 design and any alternatives identified in this process.
Mr Ivor Hoareau Dept of Water Affairs & Forestry (DWAF)	Contractors should not build additional dams as a form of compensation for farmers, especially when constructing roads.	DWAF and DAEA and will ensure that all relevant laws are complied with.  Thank you for bringing this to our attention.
	Additional dams would require written permission from both DWAF as well as Department of Agriculture and Environmental Affairs (DAEA).	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Jeff Scrooby Petronet	Petronet, being a division of Transnet Limited, has no objection in principle to the proposed EIAs for the construction and upgrade of access roads and Transmission Power Lines crossing the 323,8 and 406,4 mm diameter pipelines within Transnet's 6,1 and 6 m wide pipeline servitudes as indicated on your drawing.	Your comments and requirements are noted and Eskom will ensure that they are addressed and complied with.
	This authority to proceed shall only be valid for six months from the date of this letter. If it is envisaged that if the work will commence at a later stage an extension of time must be requested timeously.	
	CONDITIONS	
	Prior to commencement of work it is required that a representative of Petronet be present to indicate the position of the pipelines and to undertake any work on Transnet's pipelines that may be necessary. In this connection the Servitude Supervisor, Mr Klippies Kritzinger, can be contacted at 034 989 9512 at least 14 days before the date on which you wish to commence the work in the vicinity of the pipelines.	
	Arrangements will also be made to visit the site periodically whilst the work is in progress.	
	Should the work be undertaken without Petronet's representative being contacted as mentioned above, Petronet reserves the right to request that you expose the pipeline at your cost in order that an examination can be made for possible damage.	
	The attached standard conditions and requirements for overhead cables must be complied with.	
	You are requested to forward detailed drawings of the proposal on finalisation of design. Frere, Ladysmith, Elandslaagte and Besters cadastrals with pipeline routes are attached for your information and reference.	
	On completion of the work you are required to return a copy of this letter to our office, duly endorsed and designed by your site representative as well as Petronet's site representative that the work was satisfactorily completed and conditions adhered to.	
C. ISSUES APPLICAL	BLE TO BOTH PROJECTS	

17 (a) EIA Process (technical)

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Vincent Matabane Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (DEAT)	DEAT is present at the meeting to observe, not to issue a Record of Decision. The necessary applications have been lodged and the respective Plans of Study for Scoping have been accepted. DEAT encourages all stakeholders to raise issues at this early stage so that when the EIA documentation is reviewed, all the facts are incorporated. Also, stakeholders must make sure that comments have been captured correctly and addressed adequately.	DEAT has the responsibility to ensure that due process has been followed within the EIA processes.
Adv George Galloway Skeurklip Conservancy and Farm Owner	Will a visual impact assessment be conducted for the Power Lines?	The visual impact of Power Lines is a contentious issue and it is always subjective. Cave Klapwijk and Associates are the visual specialists in this EIA. The visual impact depends on who can see the Power Lines and how pristine the area is. Power Lines always constitute a medium-high impact. The proposed Power Line will be constructed adjacent to an existing line, which is a better option visually. Alternatives will be taken into consideration, including ecotourism, archaeological-cultural landscape, etc. Stakeholders must review the Draft Scoping Report and Visual Impact Assessment carefully and provide comment.
Mr Dirk Vermeulen Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	Please explain the rest of the scoping process and when the preferred alternative will be selected.	The Draft Scoping Report is currently being finalised and will be made available to the public shortly. All alternatives will be assessed and one or two will be carried forward into the impact assessment phase for specialist investigation. It is anticipated that the final choice will be made towards the end of 2005, once all criteria have been considered, including public consultation and specialist studies. Please note that I&APs will be afforded sufficient time to comment on all reports. Following the EIA (should a positive ROD be obtained), detailed design will commence in 2006 and construction will commence at the end of 2006 or the start of 2007.
Unidentified stakeholder	What is the deciding factor for environmental authorization in the EIA process, specifically regarding specialist studies?	All aspects should be considered during the EIA and nothing has higher weighting than the other. Distance, time, social, visual, biophysical, etc. are all issues that will be investigated and considered.
Abantungwa-kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authorities	Why is Eskom informing Traditional Authorities of the project when the commencing date is still far away?	Public Participation is one of the requirements of the Environmental Impact Assessment aimed at ensuring that all affected and interested parties are given an opportunity to participate, raise concerns, etc. This process is being implemented now, quite long before construction of the roads in order to ensure that all the I&APs have the opportunity to contribute to this process and raise their issues and concerns. Also, the EIA process is a lengthy one, and more consultation with I&APs will take place in the next phase of the EIA. The relevant authorities also require sufficient time to properly evaluate the application and must be satisfied that I&APs were consulted effectively. The information provided by the Traditional Authorities will inform the decision-making process.
17 (b) EIA Process (pub	olic participation)	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Tony Christopher Cotswold Farm Trust	Mr Christopher requested that we arrange a meeting with him early in 2005, as he was in Cape Town at the time of the Public Open Days. Would like to view study area maps in detail.	The Access Roads Team met with Mr Christopher on 18 February 2005 with detailed maps to discuss the proposed alternatives. His comments are included in this Comments and Response Report.
	We refer to the telephonic conversation conducted with a member of your staff on the afternoon of 26th November 2004, when the writer was informed that you have been mandated to undertake an Environmental Impact Study of the above proposed scheme, which included <i>inter alia</i> impact on surrounding farms, including Cotswold. The writer was advised that information meetings would be held in Estcourt, Ladysmith and Harrismith on 29th, 30th November and 1st December 2004. We are concerned that on a matter of substantial importance to Landowners in the area of the scheme, very little notice has been given of the meetings.	2004. Also, all registered I&APs were sent letters and background information documents during November 2004. Please note that these meetings were not the only opportunity provided where landowners could participate in the process and submit comment. The project team has made concerted effort to contact affected landowners directly and through Farmers Associations. Since the public open days, the project team has met with numerous landowners and
	Our client Trustees are quite unable to attend the meetings and we would be pleased if you would arrange to call when in Ladysmith to fully brief us as to what is intended in so far as it affects Cotswold.	See first response above.
Mr Louis Hirshon	He is not interested in the proposed projects even if his farm is affected.	Noted.
Mr Cl Outram Roseville Farming CC	He has bought a farm from Mr DC Meacher.	Noted.
Mr Davies Davies Family Trust	The farm belongs to his brother who lives in Johannesburg. However, he will forward the project information to him.	Noted.
Mr Hercules JH de Jager Harrismith Farmers Association	He would like to attend one of the planned meetings and discuss the project in detail.	Mr JH de Jager attended the Swinburne Farmers Association Meeting on 18 February 2005.
Mr Dornford Charles Meacher	We no longer live in the Winterton area. Thus the project does not concern us.	Noted.
Mr Piet Leibbrandt	Please forward a copy of the presentations done at Ladysmith Key Stakeholder meeting to me via e-mail.	Presentations were submitted to Mr Leibbrandt on 25 January 2005.
Mr Duncan Vause Dept of Agriculture & Environmental Affairs	My environmental colleagues are dealing with this matter. However please keep me on the mailing list.	Noted.
Sir Bruce Hervey Oaklands Country Manor	Few people were aware of the Public Open Days in the Van Reenen area. Even those who received the publicity material were unaware of the 2 schools that were selected. Was this deliberate?	2004. Also, all registered I&APs were sent letters and background information documents during November 2004. The schools were recommended as preferred locations for public open days. Please note that these meetings were not the only opportunity provided where stakeholders could participate in the process and submit comment and the project team did meet with stakeholders outside of the public open days on request. It should also be noted that the Public Participation Process complies with the relevant EIA legislation and Regulations, and was additionally approved by the department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism at the start of the project.
Mr Hendrik van der Merwe.	Has the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF) been consulted in this EIA process?	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Bruce Nel	interesting.	
Mthembu Traditional Authority	The Mthembu Traditional Authority has no objections to the proposed project; however, proper channels of communications have to be recognised should the Transmission Power Line be constructed through their land. All communication with the community should be done through the Traditional Authority Office.	
Abantungwa-kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authorities	Channels of communication need to be recognised by Eskom. Information has to go via the relevant Traditional Authority offices.	Noted.
	The Abantungwa-kholwa and Amahlubi Traditional Authorities are not opposed to the proposed project as long as they are kept informed of the process and Eskom follows appropriate communication channels.	Noted.
Mr Gerhard (MG) Roberts Skeurklip Conservancy	The M G Roberts Trust of which I am a trustee has recently purchased two farms bordering onto the Collingspass Road, namely the farm Maggie's Deel 1565 and the farm Happy Home 802.	and EIR. No other environmental reports have been produced to date with regard to the upgrading of the Roads. You are welcome to view the original EIA conducted for the actual Braamhoek PSS in 1999 and the associated specialist
	I have been informed that ESKOM has also purchased a farm known as Wilgerrivier 310, which would be incorporated and form part of the development envisaged by ESKOM. The farm Maggie's Deel borders onto the farm Wilgerrivier (Also known as Mooi Plaas). Whatever is planned for the farm Wilgerrivier might impact on the farm Maggie's Deel and I should therefore require certain information to enable me to meaningfully participate in the EIA presently being undertaken.	reports – these could be sent to you in electronic format. Please contact Ms, Jaana-Maria Ball in this regard. The maps provided in the BID are the latest maps showing the different alternatives.
	It would therefore be of the utmost importance if you could inform me where I could have access to the following, namely:	
	<ol> <li>All proposals and/or preliminary reports on environmental impact studies and/or assessments made.</li> <li>All proposed maps and plans pertaining to the construction and upgrade of roads in the area.</li> <li>All proposals pertaining to the establishment of a nature conservation area on the farms purchased by Eskom including maps and/or plans pertaining thereto.</li> <li>Full particulars of all the immovable property, which Eskom has purchased over and above the farms Braamhoek, Zaaifontein and Bedford.</li> <li>Whether there are any intentions to relocate farm workers in the area and in this regard all documentation pertaining to the steps already undertaking or intentions to relocate such farm workers.</li> <li>I appreciate that all this information might be voluminous and it would therefore be</li> </ol>	
	appreciated if you could let me know where I could have sight of the documents.  I also noticed in your invitation that further details are contained in the BID and it would	
	be appreciated if you could send it to me at the e-mail address referred to in the header of this letter.	proposed maps for the construction and upgrade of access roads to Mr MG Roberts.

NAME &	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION		
Mr Deon Coetzee Middelpunt Wetland Trust	We apologise again for not being able to attend the Workshop on the 30th Nov at such short notice. In fact we designated Birdlife SA to represent us.	Mr Nigel Anderson of Birdlife SA attended the Key Stakeholder Workshop held in Ladysmith on 29 November 2004.
	Could you kindly forward to us the minutes of your workshop or if and when available a workshop manual containing discussions and decisions taken.	Scoping Report.
Mr Dumisane Nkabinde Dee Dee Enterprises	Where are the Free State stakeholders and were they invited to the Key Stakeholder Workshop. Also, the Department of Transport and the Provincial Roads Agency.	stakeholders mentioned were invited to the Key Stakeholder Workshop.
Mr T Coetzee	Who has been notified about this project and how many I&APs have responded to date? What is the general feeling regarding the alternatives?	Seven advertisements were placed in various newspapers. A database of approximately 800 I&APs were initially notified via personalised letters. To date, approximately 1 000 people have been sent Background Information Documents. Approximately 50 comments have been received specifically regarding the roads. There is no indication of a preferred alternative at this stage and this will possibly emerge out of the scoping process.
Mrs Liona Kleynhans	Many of the people here registered with Eskom in March last year. Why has this information not been included onto your data base?	attendees will also be forwarded to Eskom. Please also assist the Public Participation Process by updating the database and providing additional names to be included.
Adv George Galloway	The timeframes for the entire project are unclear. Please send us a schedule of activities for the whole project. Also, at the next meeting, please ensure that representatives of Eskom are present to answer the greater strategic questions.	Draft Scoping Report. Eskom representatives will be present at the next round of meetings.
Mr Piet Roets	Please keep all contact details and forward to Eskom. When representatives of Eskom, the EIA Team or specialists come onto our property, we must be notified. This is very important.	
Mr Hendrik van der Merwe	At the next meeting, please ensure that decision-makers from Eskom are present for informative discussion.	
Mayor Gaba Makhathini Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality	The poor communities should be represented at public open days and the information presented should be suitably simplified.	team has advertised in newspapers, contacted local representatives, and sent out information to key organizations as well as various municipalities. It is unlikely that everybody in the entire study area will be contacted as it is such a large area. We rely on people to identify the issues and other groups of people who should be consulted. Meetings have been arranged with the Traditional Authorities, Farmers Associations, Government Departments, Land Owners, etc. The EIA Teams need to understand the environment to see what the best methods of communication/consultation are.
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	It is important to brief people at local authority level. It must not be taken for granted that the local people do not require consultation about proposed local developments. Local people understand the local constituents and politicians are not in a position to decide on local issues, without input from these people.	municipalities. This is another opportunity for consultation and participation.
	On 27 January 2005, there will be a DEAT and DWAF workshop in Ladysmith. Please take note of this meeting for a future consultation opportunity.	
Mr Nkosinathi Ndaba Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	Will this be the final public meeting in the consultation exercise? Where can we get further information and can we meet again to hear about the study?	EIA processes usually schedule one round of public meetings during the scoping phase. Proceedings of the meetings will be distributed for comment, and the Draft Scoping Report will also be made available for comment. Further individual meetings have been set up with Municipalities, Farmers Associations, etc. Also, please contact the Public Participation Office for further information.

NAME &	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
ORGANISATION Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	It would not be beneficial to have a second public meeting with people who did not attend the first meeting. If a second meeting is held, it should involve attendees from these meetings.	
Mr Sabelo Mazibuko Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	I suggest that you list potentially affected areas along the transmission Power Line route, including the towns, so that people can clearly understand if they will be affected by the development.	A provisional list has been drawn up and we have maps showing the study area. However, a comprehensive list would help at future meetings for clarity.
	How will you ensure that all communities will be consulted on a one-to-one basis? We cannot rely on organizations such as Farmers Associations to pass on the message to local communities.	make a point of contacting a wide variety of stakeholders and representatives. It is difficult to invite each and every person in the community to public meetings. The approach that we are using includes dealing with representatives of various constituencies, e.g. local municipalities, Traditional Authorities, Farmers Associations, Conservation Bodies, etc. acknowledging the fact that they have a mandate to represent their sector's perspective as well as feedback to their constituencies. We do not only take information from one sector.
		These public open days are about making initial contact with I&APs. Then, if necessary, we will set up individual meetings. There are very few people in favour of Power Lines, let alone farmers. Whoever has Transmission Power Lines across their property will not be happy. We need to see that their concerns are properly justified. We need to identify environmental issues. We send all issues to Eskom for their consideration and evaluation. We cannot only listen to one group of people.
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	It is important that all affected people along the road routes are consulted. They must be visited on a one-to-one basis so that all communities on the ground are engaged and capacity is built.	Once the preferred alternative is selected, more intense consultation will be conducted. However, we do try to identify as many affected people as possible at this early stage.
Mr Graham Hutton Atkinson	Please supply full details and maps or detailed plans in regard to your intentions for my farm 00001154 Kop Leegte Sub-division 00007. I cannot comment until I have proper details.	ACER forwarded maps to Mr Atkinson and his comments were subsequently received.
Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	Councillors who are responsible for Besters, Van Reenen and Brakpan fall under Emnambithi/Ladysmith Municipality.	Noted.
	Van Reenen/Besters Farmers Association has to be consulted.	This consultation has taken place and will continue for the duration of the study.
	The identification of stakeholders and relevant development committees can be done in conjunction with the Municipalities' Planning and Development Department, with input from Councillors.	Noted.
	Mrs Kubheka represents tenants living within the farms in the Besters area.	Mr James Luthuli of the Van Reenen Development Committee provided ACER (Africa) with Mrs Kubheka's contact details. Her details were added on the database.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
	Based on the map, farmers indicated that it appears as if the Turn-ins will connect from the Boschfontein Farm. They also indicated that the roads would possibly pass through the Meritz Drift Farm.	Noted.
	When will the Draft Scoping Report (DSR) be available for public review?	The DSR should be available for public review early April 2005. The Public Participation Consultant will send a letter to all registered I&APs notifying them of the DSR availability.
	Channels of communication need to be recognised by Eskom. Information has to go via the Shabalala Traditional Authority office.	Noted.
Amanteshe Traditional Authority	Communication channels need to be understood and adhered to by Eskom, Eskom Contractors and Community Leaders.	Noted.
	A meeting to report back on the findings of the study will only be necessary if their area is affected.	Noted.
18. Braamhoek Pumped	d Storage Scheme	
Mr Tony Christopher Cotswold Farm Trust	He is concerned about the source of water for the dams and what impacts these dams will have on his farm.	This has been referred to Eskom for their response.
Mr Bruce Nel	I also have a professional curiosity in the issue, having been involved in the welding inspection of the Steenbras scheme almost thirty years ago.	
Adv George (GW) Galloway Skeurklip Conservancy	Socio-Economic Profile: The residential village (construction camp?) will be constructed at the lower dam - all of a sudden such a village (camp) is also envisaged at or near Bedford.	
	No EIA regarding the Harrismith district has been done. We (the owners, farmers and Skeurklip Conservancy) want clarification as soon as possible. We'll take this up with Free State Nature Conservation as well.	
Mr Philip Gavin Drakensberg Tourism Association	Braamhoek plans in future?	has a positive Record of Decision. The other Pumped Storage Scheme will probably be in the Pietermaritzburg area or in Lesotho. These two possibilities are currently in the pre-feasibility phase of investigations.
Mr Alf Lees Ladysmith and District Farmers Association	How many megawatts will the Pumped Storage Scheme produce, once operating?	The Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme will produce 1332 MW.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Ivor Hoareau Department of Water Affairs and Forestry (DWAF)	DWAF has concerns regarding the licensing process for the two storage facilities. We are also concerned about the impacts on water resources in the area. Dams require prior written approval in each instance.  You have made mention of a ROD from DAEA, to what extent have you consulted with DWAF especially regarding your storage, and with whom?	Conservation, Cornelius Ruiters, during 2004. In addition to this, Eskom has appointed the Braamhoek Consultants Joint Venture (BCJV) to obtain the relevant Integrated Water Use Licence. The BCJV and Eskom have liaised extensively with both the Gauteng and Kwa Zulu Natal Regional Offices in this regard and are currently compiling the licence application. DWAF has indicated that the Water supply section of the Kwa Zulu Natal Region will take the lead in this licensing process. However both regions will be consulted extensively. The BCJV Environmental Team maintains continuous contact with the relevant DWAF officials. A separate Public Participation Process will be implemented for the licence application, which was approved by the Gauteng Regional Office. The officials we have dealt with thus far include:  - Gauteng Water Supply: Chief Engineer – Walther van der Westhuizen; - Gauteng Water Supply: Officer – Carl Fest; - Gauteng Water Supply: Officer – Dawie Koekemoer; - Gauteng Water Quality: Assistant Director: Dawie Maree; - Gauteng Water Quality: Officer – Dipitseng Phaleng; - Kwa Zulu Natal Water Supply: Officer – Norman Ward; - Kwa Zulu Natal Water Supply: Officer – Norman Ward; - Kwa Zulu Natal Water Quality: Assistant Director – Gravelot Blondin; and
Mr Dirk Vermeulen	If construction of the Braamhoek PSS commences without the upgraded roads, the area will experience various negative impacts. How will construction activities be synthesised?	- Kwa Zulu Natal Water Quality: Officer - Asith Brijball.  At a meeting held on 18 February 2005, the Project Team indicated that the Geotechnical Investigations were due to start within the following week. A tunnel will be dug which will eventually serve as the access tunnel to the scheme. Major construction will commence at the lower reservoir site first, for which access is no problem as the roads exist and are in a relatively good state. Also, this access route is shared by all alternatives under consideration. Once construction at the upper site commences, it is anticipated that the roads would have been constructed and upgraded.
Mr Obed Shabangu SANCO	What is the impact of developments on water demand?	For the Pumped Storage Scheme, Eskom will not utilize large quantities of water. The reservoirs will be filled once and only topped up after evaporation. Coal fired power stations use more water compared to the Pumped Storage Schemes. Eskom is a strategic water user and, therefore, gets an allocation from DWAF. It is DWAF's responsibility to ensure that there is enough water for the power stations and the population.  There will be a certain amount of water loss through evaporation, which is estimated to be 3 million cubic metres per annum (m³pa), which is relatively small.
Unidentified Stakeholder Ladysmith Public Open Day	Locally indigenous names need to be respected in projects like these. Braamhoek is not a suitable name and it is better to consider the name from the start to save money in the long-term.	Noted. The Pumped Storage Scheme will take on a more indigenous name.
Mr Nkosinathi Ndaba Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	Why is the project named after Braamhoek farm?	Braamhoek is a spruit and Bramhoek is the farm. However, the project will be renamed to something more appropriate at a later stage.

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality and Council	What is the capital investment of the project, including tunnels, turbines, transformers, etc?	Approximately R4.9 billion (Costs at 2005) of which the bulk is specialised work.
	The Drakensberg ecological sensitivity needs to be taken into consideration during construction. It was suggested that various Project Teams should work closely with the Municipal Manager.	
	Impact of the Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme on wetlands and on people drinking water from the Klipfontein River.	The Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme will improve the environment because of the filtering system. In addition, Eskom has a responsibility to monitor the wetlands. They will spend approximately R500 000 per year to ensure that the impacts on the wetlands are minimal.
	Impact of the Pumped Storage Scheme on the downstream water users, e.g. availability of water for communities.	A Hydroelectric scheme is a closed system and uses less water. Water is only lost through evaporation.
	Any plans for additional hydroelectric schemes?	The next one may be in the Steelpoort area.
Besters Farmers Association	Where will the surge tanks for the Pumped Storage Scheme be situated?	They will be situated inside the mountain. The proposed Scheme will operate like the Drakensberg Pumped Storage Scheme just outside Winterton.
	Will the construction of the Braamhoek Pumped Storage Scheme result in changes in the current "card system" electricity supply?	This has been referred to Eskom for their response.
19. Eskom Distribution	Queries	
Unidentified stakeholder Hlomisa Public Open Day	Would there be an opportunity to provide electricity to the Park East Area?	This has been referred to Eskom Distribution for their response.
Shabalala Traditional Authority and Matiwaneskop Farmers	Matiwaneskop experiences a number of problems with Eskom Distribution. The following concerns were raised:	
Association	Electricity power is weak, when there is light rain or light storm, electricity goes off. This has been going on since the installation of "card system" electricity.	Eskom is aware of the problem and they are waiting for spare transformers, which have been identified as the main cause of the problem.
	Eskom Distribution does not notify them when they are going to work on their lines. There is a vast difference in the manner in which Eskom Distribution operates in urban areas when compared to rural areas. In towns, residents are notified in time, which enables them to plan their daily activities accordingly.	
	Does Eskom distribution pay compensation for land?	

NAMI ORGANIS		ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Amanteshe Authority	Traditional	Is Eskom electrification programme linked to the proposed Braamhoek project? There are a number of areas within Roosboom without electricity.  Does this project imply that people have to wait for its completion before they can expect electricity in their houses? They have been promised electricity for a number of years	area thus making it difficult to accommodate everyone in terms of electrification of their houses. This required a new network design. Neville Booysen confirmed that this will be completed either in May or June 2005 and construction can be expected to commence either in October or November 2005.
		and no progress is being made.  What will happen in the interim in order to meet the current community electricity needs whilst Eskom Transmission is busy with construction?	
		It was suggested that the Project Team should report back during the next Emnambithi Regional Authority Meeting to be held on 11 March 2005.	
		Amanteshe Traditional Authority has made progress on their plans for building a Community Centre. The Community Centre will also be of great benefit to the surrounding communities. Most of the activities that will be done in the Centre require electricity, therefore there is an urgent need for electricity supply in the area.	

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Abantungwa-kholwa and	<ul> <li>Note: At this meeting, there was a high interest in Eskom's electrification programme. Below is a summary of comments and concerns raised. The Project Team was not in a position to respond to the questions raised; nevertheless all questions and concerns were recorded for Eskom Distribution's attention: <ul> <li>There is an urgent need for electricity in the area. It would be much better if Eskom Distribution can find ways of dealing with the current electricity requirements in the area. Is it not possible for Eskom to make a connection from Bergville?</li> <li>Communities in Driefontein and Roosboom have been waiting for a number of years for the electrification programme. They have been promised on a number of occasions that the electrification programme will roll out but progress has not been made to date. Eskom should at least inform them if they are experiencing problems. They would like to receive an explanation on the reasons behind Eskom Distribution delays and problems associated with the provision of electricity in rural areas.</li> <li>Previously, they were told that they cannot have electricity in some parts of the Driefontein area because houses are too far apart and it becomes difficult for Eskom to provide electricity in rural areas. Is this true?</li> <li>There is a vast difference in the manner in which Eskom services predominantly white areas when compared to rural areas. Why does this happen?</li> <li>Which areas receive electricity from the Colenso Sub-station?</li> <li>Eskom Distribution hardly reads electricity metres but Eskom accounts are received regularly, how accurate are the accounts sent to customers?</li> <li>Last year, 2004, Development Committees in the Driefontein area decided to visit Eskom Distribution Offices in Ladysmith with the intention of getting information regarding the delays being experienced in the electrification programme.</li> <li>Eskom Distribution informed them that they are waiting for a substation to be built in Zaaifontein. Does this mean that Eskom</li></ul></li></ul>	additional electrification in Driefontein until a new distribution substation is built. A site has been identified and arrangements for construction are under way.  Many schools, which are near existing lines, have been electrified in the area and those far away will be electrified once necessary funds are available to do so.  All clinics in the area are already electrified.  With respect to electrification programme, people can contact the nearest Eskom Walk In Centre for more information.  With regards to planned outages, prepaid customers are notified by way of notices at shops and schools. Westville Call Centre notifies SPU customers telephonically. Unfortunately, Eskom Distribution cannot notify customers if it is an emergency, i.e. unplanned outages.
20. Other queries and c Mr Edward Alexander Clouston	omments I am totally against any more KwaZulu-Natal water being pumped into the OFS and Gauteng Province.	and Tourism authorised this scheme in 2002. The current EIA deals only with
Mrs Liona Kleynhans	TSP Maluti a Phofung and Berg Bohaai is conducting research which is being funded by the Development Bank of South Africa (DBSA). There may be additional funds available for tourism projects. Eskom should discuss the possibility of a joint venture with the DBSA?	be passed on to Eskom for their consideration and possible action. The DBSA

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Hylton Green Green H Ranches cc	How much of South Africa's electricity is exported to other countries?	Approximately 2% of South Africa's demand is exported. South Africa is a net importer of electricity.
Mr Shalabh Gupta Reliance Energy Limited	We understand from the information available with us that Eskom, ACER Africa is inviting tenders for an integration project comprising of the following:  1. The Braamhoek Substation to receive electricity from Braamhoek Power Station  2. The Braamhoek-Venus 400kV transmission Power Line, to provide a second connection to the transmission National Grid System via a direct connection to the Venus Substation.  3. A 'Turn-in' from the existing Majuba-Venus 400kV transmission Power Line to connect the Substation to the Transmission National Grid System.  Reliance Energy, is the largest private sector power utility in India engaged in Generation, Transmission and Distribution activities. We are keen to participate in this tender as an EPC Contractor for which, we would like to seek some more information namely:  1. The Scope of Work.  2. The proposed length of Transmission lines to be laid.  3. Tentative project cost.  4. Procedure for procuring the Tender documents.	Tender queries fall outside of the EIA process and persons submitting such queries were informed that the newspaper advertisement to which they were responding was an invitation for participation in the EIA process and not a call for tender submissions.
Ms Thelma Battiss National Cables Pty Ltd	Requested by e-mail to have the tender documentation.	Tender queries fall outside of the EIA process and persons submitting such queries were informed that the newspaper advertisement to which they were responding was an invitation for participation in the EIA process and not a call for tender submissions.
Mr Peter Howell Group 5 Roads & Earthworks	Would be interested in tendering on civil/road works  We are awaiting award of a SANRAL road contract in the vicinity of the above scheme and would be very interested in tendering on any work that Eskom envisage putting out to tender, especially road works and dam construction. At this stage we will be grateful if you could send us a BID, as mentioned in the Sunday Times.	for tender submissions.
Mr Dumisane Nkabinde Dee Dee Enterprises	Will the access roads go through the normal tender process?	There will be open competitive tendering and the process can only commence once a Record of Decision has been issued.
Mr Sabelo Mazibuko Emnambithi/Ladysmith Local Municipality	What message does Eskom have for students of Maths and Physics?	Maths and Physics are the subjects of the future. There is a need for skilled people in South Africa and Science qualifications are very important.
Mr Jeremy Mokoena	Will Eskom assist local schools in any way?	When Eskom works in areas such as this, schools are considered and Eskom tries to improve conditions and provide assistance. This is already in process
Department of Education		and Eskom will contact the Department of Education for further advice.
Mr Alson Mavimbela	Please could Eskom provide telephones?	Unfortunately, this is not Eskom's business line and you would have to liaise with Telkom in this regard.

BRAAMHOEK TRANSMISSION POWER LINE AND SUBSTATION INTEGRATION CONSTRUCTION AND UPGRADE OF ACCESS ROADS FOR THE ESKOM BRAAMHOEK PUMPED STORAGE SCHEME

NAME & ORGANISATION	ISSUES RAISED	RESPONSE
Mr Howard Christie	I have heard that a dam will be constructed on the Wilge River. This would flood portions of my farm (Fullerton) and portions of the project area. Please provide clarification.	To the best of our knowledge, a dam on the Wilge River is not under consideration at this time. It is probable that the information you obtained concerned a previous study of the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry aimed at addressing deep scouring and erosion downstream of the Lesotho Highlands outfall into the Ash River. Various alternatives were considered but, ultimately, a series of weirs were constructed in the Ash River